Enhancing Learning Through the Use of Digital Libraries in Developing Countries Universities

Billy Mathias Kalem and Refilwe Constance Mogase
Department of Informatics, Faculty of Information and Communication Technology, Tshwane University of Technology, Pretoria, South Africa

Abstract: Developing countries universities are characterised by financial constraints, lack of qualified personnel, poor infrastructure and limited physical space. However, the increasing use of internet and the ubiquitous of Information Technology (IT) enhanced learning tools and applications are dramatically changing and bridging the gaps that existed between the learners of the rich developed and the poor developing countries. With IT, learners can now conduct research, access learning materials of other universities as well as collaborating with others within and outside their environment. It is evident that the availability of information in electronic media has on the other hand created opportunities for global access to information, increased the speed of service and has increased the number of learners being served regardless of the geographical boundaries. However, much as universities have massively invested in these digital libraries, their optimal use by many learners in developing countries is still limited. The objective of this study therefore was to investigate the usage of digital libraries at universities in developing countries and how such usage could enhance learning. This study used data collected from a university in South Africa to verify digital libraries usage. Data was collected and analyzed quantitatively. The results showed that bandwidth, system complexity, lack of skills, information overload and training significantly impact on digital libraries usage. The empirical evidence of this study is expected to serve as a cornerstone for digital libraries implementation and usage in universities not only in developing countries but also in other institutions world across.

Key words: Digital libraries, universities, technology usage, bandwidth, libraries usage, skills

INTRODUCTION

Due to emerging technologies, electronic based information materials have become more relevant in education. University libraries have taken advantage of this electronic transformation through digitalization process from paper to digital material. This shift has put emphasis on print resources where total dependence on them is no longer reasonable (Shidi and Torna, 2013).

In addition to costs, delay and bulkiness, print resources have the limitation of assuming that everyone learns at the same pace and in the same manner. This assumption makes printed resources irrelevant in today’s high-tech. This has then enabled digital technologies in taking a major lead of learning resources used by librarians to enhance service delivery to learners. Digital libraries as defined by studies are distinctive libraries that focus on a variety of electronic objects which include text, video, audio and visual resources that are stored as electronic media formats contained in a library collection (Turan and Bayram, 2013). Some of the advantages these digital libraries present amongst others include: round the clock availability, no physical boundaries and multiple distribution of resources to users, elimination of congested space to store material and cost saving (Shidi and Torna, 2013; Gakibayo et al., 2013).

Despite the presented opportunities and universities’ efforts to make digital libraries accessible to learners, the usage of these resources is still very limited. University libraries have been spending substantial amounts of their annual budgets to ensure the availability of digital libraries but much of this effort and money has helped little. Such usage has remained low despite of universities’ awareness campaigns, orientation programs and trainings (Nemati and Babalhavaeji, 2013; Kwadzo, 2015).

Usage of digital libraries in developed countries is more than those in developing ones and this could mainly be attributed to better ICT infrastructures and awareness (Dukic, 2013). Other studies have attributed this to limited computer literacy, the acceptance culture, decreasing
student’s interest in reading and perceptions in developing countries (Gakibayo et al., 2013; Isah et al., 2014).

In view that learners in developing countries are faced with numerous limitations associated with lecture-based teaching, it is imperative that they leverage digital libraries to overcome these inherent disadvantages (Chandel and Saikia, 2012; Dhavanandan and Tamizhevelvan, 2012; Makori, 2015). Therefore, this study sought to establish how learning could be enhanced by using digital libraries in developing country’s universities. This study sought to investigate the influence of learner’s self-efficacy, attitude and awareness on digital libraries usage. More still this study also investigated how digital libraries as a technological innovation is diffused among learners and the role played by the institutions as well as the environment during this diffusion.

**Literature review:** Digital libraries are an important part of growing knowledge amongst learners in universities. Studies affirmed that digital libraries are an integral part of an institution’s libraries as they help in teaching and learning activities (Zhang et al., 2011; Rioux, 2017; Makori, 2015). However, studies revealed that despite the universities efforts to make digital libraries available to learners, their use in the academic sphere is still minimum (Isah et al., 2014). Studies of Bashorun et al. (2011) indicated that in order for learners to exploit digital libraries, there is a need for them to acquire the necessary skills and practices to utilize them effectively.

This is further supported by Okite-Amughoro who emphasized that despite the availability of digital libraries, their usage is rather low. Their findings indicated that this is due to lack of training on how to access digital libraries which impacts on their efficient and effective usage.

It has been highlighted that computer literacy remains a challenge for most learners in developing countries (Gakibayo et al., 2013). Therefore, learning basic computer skills and applications is an increasing necessity to university learners. It has further been indicated that while learner’s awareness of digital libraries may lead to usage, this is not the case (Kwadzo, 2015). The study reported that level of awareness in universities is higher than the actual usage due to students not knowing which resources are relevant to their subject areas.

Furthermore as noted by other studies, it is of significance that resources such as journals and articles are current and rich in content as it is one of the critical factors that stimulate learner’s interest to use digital libraries (Nisha and Ali, 2012).

It has been noted that learners tend to use more the current digital libraries than those that are old in years of publication. Factors that hinder effective usage of digital libraries were examined and it was established that learner’s frustrations when searching for information is a core factor leading to low usage of digital libraries (Zalbed, 2013). He attributed this frustration to inadequate training in information searching skills, lack of appropriate reward for electronic scholarly communication, poor IT infrastructure, inability to access digital libraries from home, slow download speed and lack of technical support.

Based on these views it could be deduced that there are heterogeneous factors inhibiting learner’s usage of digital libraries in developing countries. Furthermore, these factors could range from the individual learner’s perceptions and capabilities as well as the institutional and environmental influences (Gakibayo et al., 2013; Makori, 2015).

**Theoretical foundations and conceptual model:** Every identified problem always has a solution which is embedded within the area of the problem itself (Nenty, 2009). Various studies have suggested solutions though with a caution that the institution and the environment of operation could play a big role hence the need for further studies based on relevant underpinning theories to investigate learner’s digital libraries low usage.

This study therefore leveraged three theories of Diffusion of Innovation (DOI), self-efficacy theory, Technology-Organization-Environment theory (TOE) and four external variables to investigate learner’s digital libraries usage. These theories and their related variables are vital in assessing learner’s usage of e-Resource and help mitigate challenges encountered by learners to enable effective usage of digital libraries. Figure 1 illustrates the research model in which these theories are articulated to investigate digital libraries usage.

**Hypotheses development:** Based on the proposed conceptual framework, constructs from various theories were combined and categorized into external variables which may assist in determining the under-utilization of digital libraries. On this basis the following seventeen hypothesis were drawn:

- $H_{1a}$: compatibility when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
- $H_{1b}$: complexity when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
- $H_{1c}$: complexity directly influence digital libraries usage
• H₆: relative advantage when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
• H₇: knowledge search domain when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage
• H₈: learner attitudes in using technology when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
• H₉: learner’s awareness of digital libraries when mediated by intention to use influence its usage
• H₁₀: Learner’s trust digital libraries and supportive staff when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
• H₁¹: computer anxiety when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage
• H₁²: personal innovativeness in IT when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
• H₁₃: prior usage of digital libraries when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
• H₁₄: systems performance when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
• H₁₅: top management support when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
• H₁₆: education and training of users when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
• H₁₇: technical support when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage
• H₁₈: technical support directly influences digital libraries usage
• H₁₉: intention to use directly influences digital libraries usage

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The study used the survey strategy where a total of 500 questionnaires were distributed to both under-graduate and post-graduate learners in different faculties of Tshwane University of Technology (TUT) South Africa. The study ensured that a good representative number of students is obtained from all the faculties. This was done by ensuring that both humanities and arts based learners are sampled equally as those of the science and ICT based. The researcher depended on instructors to distribute the questionnaire to learners either before or after the lecture.

Sampling within the lecture environment was to all learners present for that particular lecture. This saw all distributed questionnaires returned however only 446 were usable as some had incomplete data especially in the learner’s demographic study and for the intention to use construct and they were discarded. The usable questionnaires were screened, coded and transcribed using the statistical package for social scientists (SPSS V.22.0).

The measuring instrument’s overall reliability was 0.915, a value greater than the required threshold of 0.07 (Hong and Nhun, 2012). Individual constructs were also tested for reliability using Cronbach’s alpha (α) and they were found to have reliability values above the recommended threshold. Knowledge search domain was one of the construct that had a slightly lower value of 0.697 which was below the recommended
threshold. However, due to the value’s proximity of the expected threshold of 0.7, the construct was used for further analysis.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Demographics: Findings indicate that majority of respondents 335 (78.7%) uses internet on a daily basis. This high percentage is a positive indication that respondents are familiar with the use of technology, thus suggesting that other factors apart from technological ones should be given attention.

Although, the majority of respondents indicated that they do use internet, only 125 (28%) are use it four or more hours on a daily basis. This implies that the times spend using and accessing material-resources is very minimal.

Digital libraries usage: Participants were further asked to indicate whether they use digital libraries and their usage frequency. The results indicated that 302 (67.7%) of the respondents use digital libraries while 144 (32.3%) don’t use. However, the frequency in which digital libraries are used is relatively low, 175 (39.2%) of the respondents use them on a weekly basis while 271 (60.8%) of the respondents use them only once a week or don’t use them at all, thus implying the ineffective usage of digital libraries.

Challenges when accessing and using digital libraries: More still, participants were asked to indicate challenges they encounter when accessing and using digital libraries. A large number of respondents 249 (55.5%) indicated that they never struggle finding a number of titles when accessing digital libraries, whilst 232 (52%) of participants indicated that they do not find it difficult to find relevant information when they use digital libraries. Additionally, 273 (61.2%) of the respondents indicated that they never have limited access to digital libraries as they could access and use the services at home and 206 (46.2%) indicated that they have never been affected by download time. These average levels of accessibility of digital libraries indicates that accessibility does not seem to be a huge barrier to using digital libraries, thus suggesting that, there is a need for other factors apart from e-Resource accessibility that still need to be explored.

The results further indicated that the most accessed type of digital libraries by learners are e-Books with a total number of 154 (34.5%) of respondents confirm that they have ever used them. This is followed by e-Journals with a total of 83 (18.7%) whereas the least accessed digital libraries were bibliographic databases and library catalogues with a total of 53 (11.8%) and 83 (18.7%), respectively while 52 (11.7%) respondents indicated others. These findings suggest that, although many learners do use digital libraries, only a limited number were being utilized.

Upon completion and conclusion of demographics, frequencies and reliability tests both correlation and regression analysis were carried out to give the strength and direction of the linear relationship between variables and to determine how each construct contribute to digital libraries usage. Results indicated that computer anxiety has no significant correlation with relative advantage and compatibility, whilst learner’s attitude showed a significant relationship with relative advantage, compatibility, complexity, computer anxiety and personal innovativeness at 0.01 levels.

Furthermore, overall usage of digital libraries was also found to be significantly correlated with all other constructs at a 0.01 level of significance. Similarly, intention to use digital libraries was also found to have a significant correlation with all other constructs at 0.01 level of significance.

Regression: Obuh noted that for the independent construct's influence to the dependent one to be significant, its critical ratio (t-value) should be equal or greater to ±1.96. Regression analysis was carried out and the results indicated an overall model prediction of 64.6% ($R^2 = 0.646$). Table 1 shows the results of regression analysis.

Table 1 demonstrated that out of the 14 constructs, 9 were found to significantly contribute to the overall digital libraries usage prediction whilst 6 were rejected. The contributing constructs are complexity, systems performance, relative advantage, intention to use, learner's attitudes, educational training users, e-Resource awareness, technical support and students trust on digital libraries in their highest value of contribution, respectively. Those that were insignificantly contributing were compatibility, computer anxiety, e-Resource prior usage personal innovativeness, top management support and knowledge search.

Hypotheses testing: About 17 hypothesis were tested based on the results. Table 2 shows the results of the tested hypothesis with their significant value of $p = 0.05$. of the 17, 11 hypothesis were accepted.

The study examined the factors that could influence effective usage of e-Resource at universities in developing countries. From this study, it was established that of the fourteen constructs that were used to measure usage, 9 were found to be significant to the overall prediction of the model. These include complexity, relative advantage, learner’s attitudes, learner’s awareness, learner’s trust, system performance, education and
training of users, technical support and extension to use. These findings are in agreement with those of Rosa and Lamas (2013) which iterated that much as awareness levels of digital libraries are generally greater, learners need to know more of databases especially those that are very relevant to their subject areas.

Furthermore, when learners know which digital libraries are relevant to their field of studies, they are more likely to use them. The findings are further in agreement (Adenyi and Ajiboye, 2013) who postulated that for digital libraries to be used effectively, the universities should ensure that technical support is made available. That is, ensuring that there is enough network computers available to learners and also improves on low internet bandwidth issues. This is in consistency with findings by Adenyi and Ajiboye (2013) and Adegbore (2011) which indicated that there is a need for back-up generators and also that libraries should have their own autonomous broadband internet server to enable users to have uninterrupted internet access.

The results further indicated that complexity and system performance of digital libraries site has an influence to effective usage of digital libraries. This findings concurred with previous studies by Nasreen and Alawi (2011), Hong and Nhung (2012) assertion that user-friendliness of a system can influence users in users it. Another study by Al-Muaythir et al. (2014) is further in support of ensuring that digital libraries system is of high performance for learners to have trust in the services it provides and eventually influence its use. Their study show that special attention should be given to the evaluation of e-Learning and other digital education systems and appropriate guidelines and effective methodologies must be applied by evaluators to ensure high quality systems performance.

Various studies have been conducted on learner’s usage of digital libraries in universities to date there hasn’t be clear indications as to which factors significantly influence their effective usage. The vigorousness in designing the composite model implied

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Multiple regression and collinearity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative advantage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complexity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer anxiety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal innovativeness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-resource prior usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>System performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge search</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student attitude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e_Resource_awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student trust e_Resource</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical_factors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top_management_support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational_training_users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention_to_use</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2: Hypothesis testing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Suggested hypothesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: compatibility when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: complexity when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: complexity directly influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: relative advantage when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: knowledge search domain when mediated by intention to use influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: learners attitudes in using computers when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: learner’s awareness of digital libraries when mediated by intention to use influence its usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: learner’s trust digital libraries and supportive stuff when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: computer anxiety when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: personal innovativeness in IT when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: prior usage of digital libraries when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: systems performance when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: top management support when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: education and training of users when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: technical support when mediated by intention to use will influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: technical support will directly influence digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H&lt;sub&gt;0&lt;/sub&gt;: intention to use directly influences digital libraries usage</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
that most of the influential factors were incorporated. Hence, the empirical findings of study will be of significant theoretical and practical contribution.

Firstly, this implies that universities could use the designed model as a cornerstone that will inform the use of digital libraries and assist in making relevant decisions relating to use of technology. Furthermore, researchers can adopt the model to be used as a reference, not only to extend studies of digital libraries but also in technology usage in general.

Secondly, universities in developing countries can adopt the model to enhance the use of digital libraries. This will also help libraries and management to do proper planning and strategy development to maximize use of technology in universities.

CONCLUSION

The study looked at the usage of digital libraries and the factors that play a role in the usage process. To achieve that, the study explored factors influencing the effective usage of digital libraries. It was found that awareness of digital libraries is greater than usage; therefore, learners need to be equipped with the required skills to effectively use them. This concurs with numerous studies by Bashorun et al. (2011), Adeniyi and Ajiboye (2013), Enwanta and Nwalo (2013).

Findings of the study also indicated the learner’s ability to use the internet which implied their familiarity with using technology. However, this is negatively influenced by bandwidth issues such speed and network interruptions. To combat the problem, libraries should own autonomous broadband internet servers to eliminate interrupted internet access and ensure continuous maintenance on them.

Furthermore, out of the fourteen reliable factors that may influence the effective use of digital libraries, the study found eight to be significant, which implies that they positively influence the user of digital libraries. The results further highlight that education and training of users and complexity were the most critical factors, followed by awareness of digital libraries, technical support, relative advantage, learner’s attitude, learners’ trust in resources and systems performance. Based on the findings, the proposed model was then validated with its related hypothesis.

Universities offer courses that support relevant and sustainable technologies which are transferable and applicable to different spheres of curriculums. These technologies enable learners to access high quality digitalized resources that are in support of achieving their performance and academic goals. When these technologies are not utilized optimally, it results in universities losing on their investments. In order for universities to maximize and gain profit on investments they should provide sustainable and adequate resources to users.

LIMITATIONS

Participant’s demographics were only analyzed for frequency reporting and were not included in the final analysis. This might have impacted on the prediction of the framework as moderating effects of the demographics were not included. More so, individual’s perceptions change with time hence moderating effects could have shown the trends of change if they had been included in the final analysis.

Management needs to increase of ICT network and bandwidths to ensure high access speed of digital libraries. Provide adequate training, awareness programs and increase marketing strategies of digital libraries that goes beyond just library orientation.

There should be collaboration between instructors and librarians to encourage usability of digital libraries. This could be accomplished through assigning learners with projects, assignments and group work that’s more research-based to encourage and motivate them to use digital libraries. Continuous learning programs for librarians are required to ensure upgrade of knowledge and skills in order to provide assistance to learners to encourage digital library usage. Developed digital libraries systems should be of high quality, easy to use and very flexible to adjust to technology changing demands.

RECOMMENDATIONS

This study was conducted in a developed country South Africa where ICT infrastructure and level of awareness of digital libraries is minimum as compared to that of developed countries. Findings of the study further indicated other factors such as complexity, relative advantage, learner’s attitudes and trust of learners on digital libraries, systems performance, education and training of users to be impediments of effective usage of digital libraries. However, this does not limit other factors that might influence usage. As a result recommendations were made for future research.

The study recommends that future studies sought to incorporate demographics in the analysis of factors influencing effective use of digital libraries in developing countries universities.

This study focused on learners of one university in South Africa. Although, participants represented the majority of digital library users, future research can generalise these findings to other samples such as both academic and support staff members and also a comparative study could be carried out on the same subject between universities to include more participants.
REFERENCES


