

Maritime Tourism Development Planning in Palu Bay

¹Abunawas Tjaija, ¹Awat Suliso, ¹Abdul Rivai, ¹Hasbullah,
²Sharifah Zarina Syed Zakaria and ²Muhammad Rizal Razman
¹Faculty of Social and Political Sciences (FISIP),

Tadulako University (UNTAD), 94117 Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia
tjaijaabu@yahoo.com, +628 152 404 3641, awatsuliso@untad.ac.id, +628 539 744 1564,
abdulrivai@unyad.ac.id, +628 539 687 0234, Hasbullah_17@yahoo.com, +628 232 121 6664,

²Research Centre for Sustainability Science and Governance (SGK),
Institute for Environment and Development (LESTARI),
Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM), 43600 Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia
szarina@ukm.edu.my, +6019 7458385, mrizal@ukm.edu.my, +6012 629 3185

Abstract: This study aims to analyze the process of maritime tourism development planning in Palu Bay. The type of research used is qualitative descriptive analysis approach that describes maritime tourism development planning process in Palu Bay with development planning strategy such as: normative criteria: sustainability, local condition and relevance and the eligibility criteria: infrastructure, finance, human resources and information system. Data collection is done through observation, interview and documentation. The results showed that the planning process of maritime tourism development in Palu Bay by considering the criteria of development planning strategy mandated by the Constitution No. 25 of 2004 about national development planning system is can be implemented based on the planning stage but not yet optimal. While the determinant factors that support are the availability of facilities and adequate infrastructure and human resources with sufficient competence. The inhibiting factors are a very limited budget, inadequate information systems and the occurrence of inequality in the tourism bureaucracy.

Key words: Maritime, tourism, development, planning, human resources, data collection

INTRODUCTION

The local government system gives wide authority to each region to build and manage the resources owned to increase the prosperity of the people in the region but still within the framework of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia (Fernada, 2003). The bureaucracy is expected to improve the welfare of an independent, fair and prosperous society (Fernada, 2003; Razman *et al.*, 2009a-c). The main purpose of planning is to ensure that development activities are effective, efficient and have clear objectives. But the reality shows that in practice there are often environmental changes as well as new demands that are beyond expectations and not included in the planning. Such as this is a phenomenon in the maritime tourism development planning of Palu city, central sulawesi province.

Palu city government always takes certain strategic and coordinated policies in the development planning.

Based on good governance, attitudes and commitments of individual apparatus who plays a role in each Satuan Kerja Perangkat Daerah (SKPD) or regional work unit are obliged to carry out development planning in accordance with the task of authorities they have. The Palu City government is faced with various demands of society as well as on various laws of the Republic of Indonesia such as Constitution No. 25 of 2004 on national development planning system, Constitution No. 32 of 2004 regarding regional government and Palu city government regulation No. 12 of 2007 on Establishment of organization and work procedure of Palu city's technical institution including tourism and culture office. All of this brings the logical consequence of the need for restructuring of the city of Palu in accordance with the potential and characteristics of Palu society.

Palu city's long-term development plan indicates that the development program, especially in the maritime tourism sector in Palu Bay coordinated by the Regional

Corresponding Author: Muhammad Rizal Razaman, Research Center for Sustainability Science and Governance (SGK),
Institute for Environment and Development (LESTARI), Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia,
43600 UKM Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia mrizal@ukm.edu.my, +6012 629 3185

Development Planning Agency (Bappeda) has not been a top priority. This tendency is seen in the percentage of development budget proposed related to maritime tourism development planning such as: tourism and culture office (25%), spatial Service (10%), Department of Community Empowerment and Governance (10%), Department of Trade, Industry and Cooperatives (15%), public works office (18%), fisheries and maritime office (12%) and Bappeda (10%).

The lack of budget is a proof that the seriousness or political will of Palu city government towards the development of maritime tourism is still very low. This makes development in the field has not been able to improve coastal communities in Palu Bay. It is seen that the implementation of development planning in the maritime tourism sector tends to pay less attention to the fulfillment of criteria as mandated by the national development planning law regarding threshold and normative benchmark.

The results of Kaharu (2010) revealed that the fulfillment of threshold and normative criteria as a strategic aspect of regional development planning is crucial to the successful implementation of development in various sectors. While Prasojito (2003) finds several factors that determine the effectiveness and efficiency of development planning formulation such as legal base aspect, human resources, information system technology and cost.

Public administration theory's perspective: Keban (2004) sees bureaucracy as no longer a sole agent for the implementation of government functions but also serves as a catalyst and facilitator between government and society. This perspective is in line with Hegel's idea that bureaucracy serves as a bridge between government and society are known as Hegelian Bureaucracy (Keban, 2004). Therefore, the public concept is often paired with the concept of civil society (Emrizal and Razman, 2010; Keban, 2004; Razman *et al.*, 2010; Sulaiman and Razman, 2010). Public administration, through its public servants has the role of creating democracy (Denhardt and Denhardt, 2007) helping to empower society in the form of "organized democracy" (Martin, 2002) the government should be directed to serving society in order to achieve "democratic governance" (Razman *et al.*, 2014, 2015).

The old of public administration concept implements policies and provides services with neutral, professional and faithful towards the intended purpose (Syafiie, 2006). New public management concept wants to eliminate the inefficient monopoly of services performed by the agencies and government officials. New Public Service perspective (NPS) by Wamsley and Wolf illustrates the

importance of engaging the public in public administration in a position of a citizen not just as a customer. This emphasizes that the importance of a democratic government that promotes public participation in public administration.

Planning: Planning is understanding and analyzing current conditions, predicting the development of relevant uncontrollable factors, estimating limiting factors and establishing expected goals (Razman and Azlan, 2009; Razman, 2014, 2015). Factual evidence and assumptions translated as a process of logical argument into the implementation of the policy to achieve the goal (Riyadi and Bratakusumah, 2005). The process of using existing resources with the goal of achieving certain future goals (LAN-BPKP, 2000). Riyadi and Bratakusuma (2005) who sees planning as an attempt to select and relate facts and use assumptions about the future. Planning as a management function is the decision-making process of a number of choices to achieve the desired goal (Razman and Azlan, 2009; Razman, 2014, 2015). Planning also as the process of selecting organizational goals, determining the policies and programs needed to achieve specific goals (Razman and Azlan, 2009; Razman 2014, 2015).

Planning can be seen as a means to achieve the objectives such as guidelines for the activities implementation, an estimation is made (procasting), having the best alternative, the preparation of priority scale and measuring instrument or supervision standard (Tjokroamidjojo, 1987). Thus, it can be said that planning is a process to determine the right future action to achieve what is desired through a choice by considering the facts and situations that may be encountered.

Good planning has the following requirements, based on the purpose of development, consistency and reality, continuous monitoring, achieving physical and financing aspects, bridging various characteristics of relationships between economic variables and good conditions (Kunaryo, 1992).

Development: Development as a planned process of change from one national situation to another higher national situation (Tjokroamidjojo, 1980). Steady progress towards improving human living conditions (Tjokroamidjojo, 1994). A thorough and dynamic improvement of living standards of society (Tjokroamidjojo, 1994), made consciously to create social change through modernization (Tjokroamidjojo, 1987). Advancing or improving a state through various stages in a planned and sustainable manner (Siagian, 1987, 1991). Thus, the development program is strongly influenced by the internal and external environment, so, the interaction

between development with the environment aims to improve the standard of living and welfare of the community (Siagian, 1987, 1991).

Development planning: Development planning can be defined as the process of formulating alternatives decision based on data and facts to implement a series of social activities, both physical and non-physical in order to achieve better goals (Siagian 1987, 1991). More specifically, Riyadi and Bratakusumah (2005) see regional development planning as a process to make changes towards a better development for a community, government and the environment by utilizing various existing resources and must have a complete overall orientation but still on principle priority. In the context of government regulation No. 8 of 2008 Article 4 on the stages of regional development plans are: regional development plan includes RPJPD, RPJMD and RKPD. The regional development plan as referred to in paragraph one shall be prepared by stages: the original drafters, the implementation of development planning conference, formulation of the final plan and plan-setting. In realizing good governance and oriented towards the realization of people's welfare, society should be optimally involved in active actions to oversee the whole set of development planning processes undertaken at the village, sub-district and district levels.

Planning in development administration perspective: Representative planning is a strategic aspect of achievement of development objectives drawn up by the relevant government through a container of planning bodies (Tjokroamidjojo, 1994). The concept of planning according to, government regulation No. 8 of 2008 Article 1 is "Planning is a process for determining the right future action, through a sequence of options, taking into account the available resources". The concept is reinforced (Fattah, 2008) that planning is the process of determining the goals or targets to be achieved. Nicholas White by Siagian (2000) and Sondang (2004) define that planning basically has three stages of activity that cannot be separated: the formulation of goals, selection of programs and the identification and deployment of an unlimited number of sources.

Planning in the perspective of development administration can be seen from various formulations put forward by experts, namely: planning is a process of systematically preparing activities to be performed. Sedarmayanti (2001) the selection of a set of activities undertaken by whom when and how (Handoko, 2008). The preparation of a set of decisions to be implemented (Kunaryo, 1992). The process by which objectives, factual evidence and assumptions are translated as a process of

logical argument into policy implementation (Riyadi and Bratakusumah, 2005) and is a selection and linking of facts, using assumptions about the future in making the formulation of 2 activities (Terry, 1964).

Development management: Development management is part of the national development system and is also part of the state administration system. Development management is defined as planning, mobilization, performance the direction of implementation, financing or control of power and funds (elements of leadership and motivation) and supervision to support the national development process (Siagian, 1987, 1991). Development management is the overall management of community development efforts where the government acts as a "wheel-hog" or flywheel. The role of an agent of change is the transfer of technology, transfer of value the development of self-participation and capacity building. Development management deals with the government sector the private sector and the cooperative sector where all three exist and have familial working relations.

The perspective expressed by development planning experts is basically to adopt a policy by considering the following: choosing the best alternatives, appropriately allocated resources, a systematic formula based on the interests of the public, linked to the target group, future interests. In Indonesia there are three known development pattern: long-term development, medium-term development and short-term development pattern. Planning in the perspective of development management is a process that can be implemented, thus, it needs institutions that are weighted as a container to do the preparation of a plan, for example, development planning agency.

Determinant factors in maritime tourism development planning process in Palu Bay include e-Government, commitment and synergy of apparatus, Human Resources (HR), facilities and infrastructure, Standard of Operating Procedures (SOP) and coordination among relevant Institutions. Several studies have shown that with e-Government the quality of tasks and functions of the SDKPD formed by the government with improved performance (Vassilakis) citizen participation in public activity is also increasing (Lytras) public confidence in government increases (Abie *et al.*, 2004) and bureaucracy government can be more accountable (Eyob, 2004, Gonzales and Holzer) as well as transparent (Eyob, 2004, Wescott, 2005). Even decision making within the public bureaucracy will be more precise, accurate and secure (Millett, 1954).

The importance of coordination among the relevant agencies involved in the development planning process such as preventing the occurrence of chaos and

vacancies, harmonize work, all elements of management must assist the achievement of organizational goals, all work must be integrated and all facilities and infrastructure should be utilized to achieve the objectives. Effective coordination can be seen in the application of coordination aspect (KISS) namely: coordination, integration, synchronization and simplicity (LAN-BPKP, 2000).

MATERIALS AND METHODS

This research is classified as qualitative research, using a phenomenological approach to see the facts or problems that exist in the field as the symptoms that can be observed and analyzed as an object of research studies. The location of this study is at the tourism department of Palu city. Descriptive research with qualitative approach aims to describe systematically and analytically about the characteristics of an individual a particular symptom or group or to determine the spread of a symptom of a certain relationship between one symptom with other symptoms in this study, the process of maritime tourism development planning in the Palu Bay. The data sources is the informants that have the representative value and have the competency about the subject of this study study as many as 10 people, namely: PIC of service, secretary of the department, head of division, PIC of Bappeda, head of Bappeda's division program, PIC of spatial planning service, head of community empowerment board and government, PIC of public works office of Bina Marga and head of facilities and infrastructure's division, PIC of Department of Fisheries and Marine and PIC of Industry, Trade and Cooperatives Department.

The consistency of the use of instruments in a qualitative study always refers to instruments that indicate the capacity of individual studies. Therefore, the instrument in this study is the researcher himself (human instrument) (Sugiyono, 2005). The data obtained through the direct interview (interview) observation and documentation.

Data analysis technique used in this research is qualitative descriptive technique which is analyzed by using the phenomenological interactive model by looking at the process of a policy implementation (Miles and Huberman, 1992), namely: data collection, data reduction, data display, data verification and conclusion. Data processing in this research is done by triangulation examination technique which is examination technique in criteria of credibility. According to, Moleong (2001) triangulation technique can be done by comparing data of observation result and interview result data with the informant.

Maritime tourism development planning process in Palu

Bay: Planning is undertaken to find out and analyze current conditions, forecast the development of relevant uncontrollable factors, estimate the limiting factors, set objectives and targets that are expected to be achieved and seek steps to achieve those objectives. Planning can be seen as a process where logical arguments meet the application of policies to achieve goals. Planning can be interpreted as an ongoing process that involves decisions or options for the use of existing resources with the goal of achieving certain goals in the future. The following phases can be put forward in a planning process: a review of the situation can be a review prior to starting a plan, approximate circumstances of the time to be planned, determination of plan objectives and selection of means of achievement.

To understand the implications of the relationships between the various variables and parameters in the economic and social fields as a whole, first, we need to identify the policies and business activities that need to be done in the plan. To be more operational, the activities planned are done based on the selection of the best alternative. This is done based on opportunity cost and priority scale. For development projects the identification is supported by feasibility studies and preliminary surveys of policy formulation and sectoral programs. second, sectoral suggestions are made. The final stage of the researchers of this plan is the approval stage of the plan. The process of decision-making in stages, from the verdict in the technical field then enter the territory of the political process.

The planning process requires continuous evaluation this is often referred to as a concurrent review. Evaluation is also done as a supporter of the stage of preparation of the plan, i.e., evaluation of the situation before the plan starts from the evaluation of the implementation of the previous plan. From these evaluation results an improvement on subsequent planning or adjustments required in the implementation of the planning itself can be done. It can be described the implementation of standard operating procedures as a reference aspect of the guidance of the implementation of the development planning process implemented by the Palu city government.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Development planning program's strategy

Normative criteria: Characteristics determine the opportunity to develop a tourism destination. On-site management, including the provision of new facilities, planting or introduction of vegetation, accommodation,

shopping entertainment facilities and the arrangement of access to the region will determine the success of tourism destination development. Techniques often used in the development of tourism destinations is carrying capacity (carrying capacity area).

Determining the characteristics of destinations or areas that will be developed as a tourist area. Ecotourism

planning techniques known as Tourism Opportunity Spectrum (TOS). The TOS assumes that the measurement and assessment spectrum of planning indicators used should be: observable and measurable can be controlled under control management, directly related to the preferences of tourists and has characteristics with certain conditions.

Compliance indicators “relevance ” as one element of strategic considerations in the planning of maritime tourism development in the Palu Bay is largely determined by its compatibility with other activities in the development area. Some activities have direct impacts such as deforestation, waste disposal, fishing and coral reefs and so on. In tourism opportunity spectrum mentioned that the higher the degree of compatibility of tourism destinations development the greater the chances of its development.

The compliance of the “local conditions ” indicator is a serious concern of regional work unit in charge of development such as roads, bridges, sidewalks and drainage but still, considers the environmental impact assessment and acceptability level of local communities to ensure the sustainability of marine tourism development planning in Palu bay.

The compliance of “sustainability” indicator has been applied by some related regional work unit, especially, Palu city culture and tourism office is a very important aspect in a development planning process, therefore, all variables related to the achievement of development goals can be identified, verified, analyzed and reviewed comprehensively, integratively and proportionally to produce a representative planning draft as a master plan for development planning, particularly in the marine tourism sector in Palu Bay.

Based on the results of the analysis and study of the research focus it can be concluded that the application of the compliance of indicators of sustainability, local conditions and relevance “has not been applied optimally” by regional work unit related to marine tourism development planning in Palu Bay.

Eligibility criteria: The compliance of “financial” indicator of maritime tourism development planning in Palu Bay shows an unfavorable trend in each year’s

budget. Government of Palu city tends to show less serious political will. This is due to the limited special development planning budget of the tourism sector allocated to regional work unit involved in the sector.

The compliance of “human resources ” indicator as strategic consideration in planning, related regional work unit has been supported by human resources with adequate competence, so that, it can formulate the concept of representative planning.

The compliance of the “information system”, implemented, so far, ideally meets operational standards but information is often late to be accessed because it uses manual information systems and is also more due to informed data being unprepared. Based on the results of the analysis and study of the focus of the study it can be concluded that the implementation of the compliance of financial indicators, human resources, information systems “not yet met proportionally” by regional work unit associated with marine tourism development planning in Palu Bay.

The determinant factors in the process of maritime tourism development planning in Palu Bay is divided into two aspects, namely internal and external aspects. Internal aspects include facilities and infrastructure, human resources, standard operational procedures, coordination with related agency and e-Government. Facilities and infrastructure is a determinant factor that is very influential on the existence of the dynamics of an organization that is expected to perform activities effectively, efficiently and productively. Culture and tourism office of Palu city together with regional work unit related to marine tourism development in Palu Bay are not supported by adequate facilities and infrastructure. HR planning apparatus on regional work unit related to maritime tourism development planning process in Palu Bay basically have adequate competence, so as to formulate a more proportional and representative planning. Standard of Operating Procedures (SOP) in the form of technical guidelines and technical guidelines have supported the process of marine tourism development planning in Palu Bay based on Constitution No. 25 of 2004 regarding national development planning system.

There are two common ways to coordinate: plans and feedback. Coordination in the context of the plan is executed according to, a predetermined schedule. Coordination in the context of feedback involves the transfer of new information that allows for adjustments necessary to meet the organization’s needs arising from the day-to-day activities of the system. This has been done by inter-related regional work unit but not optimal. The existence of e-Government in the perspective of the implementation of marine tourism development planning

process in Palu Bay is not yet available adequately, so, the marine tourism development planning system cannot be held as expected. External aspects include maritime tourism infrastructure and facilities, implementation of marine tourism promotion, implementation of marine tourism promotion, HR qualification and commitment in maritime, security, various marine tourism, port and airport facilities and infrastructure and partnership in the management of marine tourism.

Tourism infrastructures are natural resources and human resources that are absolutely needed by tourists in their travels in tourist destinations such as roads, electricity, water, telecommunications, terminals and ports. Tourist attractions are not yet available and visitors find it difficult get clean water, hotels, restaurants and electricity. The facilities and infrastructure of sea transportation available in Palu city are very limited, thus, the accessibility of people to and from the archipelago is limited. Palu city government along with tourism actors do not carry out the promotion of maritime tourism and the lack of promotion costs makes it less well known both domestically and abroad which certainly affects the number of tourists who come to the city of Palu. The human resources of stakeholders are not yet supportive, thus, less support for commitment and synergy in the management of marine tourism in Palu Bay. Security in Palu is not very conducive to horizontal conflicts between the nuanced and religious populations that often occur greatly affects the number of foreign tourists visiting, often carried out raids such as by municipal police and certain groups.

Palu Bay has the following advantages: maritime sports tour (sunbathing, swimming, sailing competitions, sandeq, boat races, fishing competition, beach volley and jet ski); maritime tourism (diving, marine park, yacht, sea photo exhibition), tourism education and marine research and sustainable management of coral reefs.

Palu city is supported by Pantoloan harbour which also serves as an export port which is approximately 1,500 m long with a depth of about 18 m. The mutiara sis Al Jufri airport also greatly supports the smoothness of air transportation. The private sector strongly supports the development of maritime tourism: tourism industry association (Asita). The association of hotels and restaurants (PHRI) and other organizations that have opened the market through an international tourism network. In addition, Palu city government has also made partnerships with the government of Bali in promoting the attraction of maritime tourism with Palu water front city icon.

CONCLUSION

Culture and tourism office together with related regional work unit in marine tourism development planning in Palu Bay has arranged the program based on stages of the planning process in accordance with the sectoral scope of authority.

The strategic aspects of planning are: normative criteria, namely: sustainability, regional conditions and relevance, eligibility criteria, namely: infrastructure, financial, HR and information systems cannot be applied optimally by some regional work unit. However, in this case, the Culture and Tourism Office and Public Works Department of Bina Marga which has applied the compliance with eligibility criteria with infrastructure indicators and human resources in the planning of marine tourism development.

Determinant factors related to maritime tourism development planning process in Palu Bay from internal aspect as follows: supporting factor: human resources of apparatus planner and the existence of SOPs, operational guidelines and technical processes of development planning and inhibiting factors: ineffective coordination among related regional work unit, lack of commitment and synergy of apparatus planners and e-Government less support. External aspects, namely: supporting factors: the availability of port and airport facilities and infrastructure many kinds of maritime tourism attraction and partnerships in the management of maritime tourism and inhibiting factors, namely: the limited facilities and infrastructure of maritime tourism, lack of maritime tourism attraction promotion; lack of synergy between maritime tourism actors, less conducive security and the imbalance that occurs in the bureaucracy of maritime tourism.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Part of this study was conducted by using funding from the research project code XX-2017-006.

REFERENCES

- Abie, H., B. Foyn, J. Bing, B. Blobel and P. Pharow *et al.*, 2004. The need for a digital rights management framework for the next generation of e-Government services. *Electron. Government Intl. J.*, 1: 8-28.
- Denhardt, J.V. and R.B. Denhardt, 2007. *The New Public Service: Serving, not Steering*. ME Sharpe. New York, USA., Pages: 728.
- Emrizal and M.R. Razman, 2010. The study on international environmental law and governance: Focusing on the montreal protocol and the role of transboundary liability principle. *Soc. Sci.*, 5: 219-223.

- Eyob, E., 2004. e-Government: Breaking the frontiers of inefficiencies in the public sector. *Electron. Government. Intl. J.*, 1: 107-114.
- Fattah, N., 2008. [Educational Management Platform]. PT Remaja Rosdakarya, Bandung, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Fernada, 2003. [Ethics of Government Organizations]. Lembaga Administrasi Negara, Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Handoko, T.H., 2008. [Management]. 2nd Edn., BPFE Publisher, Yogyakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Kaharu, U., 2010. [Strategy for Developing the Integrated Planning Coordination of Gorontalo Province Bappeda]. State University of Makassar, Makassar, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Keban, J.T., 2004. [Six Strategic Dimensions of Public Administration: Concepts, Theories and Issues]. Penerbit Gava Media, Yogyakarta, Indonesia, ISBN:9789793469225, Pages: 234 (In Indonesian).
- Kunaryo, 1992. [Development Planning and Financing]. UI Publishing, Central Jakarta, Indonesia, ISBN:9789794561003, Pages: 215 (In Indonesian).
- LAN-BPKP, 2000. [Accountability and good governance, Module 1 Jakarta Akuntabilitas Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah (AKIP) socialization system]. LAN and Badan Pengawasan Keuangan dan Pembangunan, Jakarta, Indonesia. (In Indonesia)
- Martin, S., 2002. Best Value: New Public Management or New Direction. In: *New Public Management*, McLaughlin, K., S.P. Osborne and E. Ferlie (Eds.). Routledge Company, Abingdon, UK., ISBN:0-203-99636-4, pp: 129-140.
- Miles, M.B. and M.A. Huberman, 1992. *Qualitative Data Analysis: Source Books about New Methods*. UI Press, Jakarta, Indonesia, ISBN:9789794561034, Pages: 491 (In Indonesia).
- Millet, J.D., 1954. *Management in the Public Service: The Quest for Effective Performance*. McGraw-Hill Education, New York, USA., Pages: 417.
- Moleong, L.J., 2001. [Qualitative Research Methodology]. PT Remaja Rosdakarya, Bandung, Indonesia, (In Indonesia).
- Prasojo, E., 2003. [Management Information System]. Bumi Aksara PT, East Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Razman, M.R. and A. Azlan, 2009. Safety issues related to Polychlorinated Dibenzo-p-Dioxins (PCDDs) and Polychlorinated Dibenzofurans (PCDFs) in fish and shellfish in relation with current Malaysian laws. *J. Food Agric. Environ.*, 7: 134-138.
- Razman, M.R., 2014. Sale of goods act, 1957: The role of statutory implied terms towards food and environmental sustainability. *Res. J. Appl. Sci.*, 9: 624-628.
- Razman, M.R., 2015. A study on global financial mechanisms in the montreal protocol from environmental law and management perspectives. *Int. Bus. Manage.*, 9: 111-116.
- Razman, M.R., A.S. Hadi, J.M. Jahi, A.H.H. Shah and A.F. Mohamed *et al.*, 2009b. The international law mechanisms to protect human habitat and environment: Focusing on the principle of transboundary liability. *Int. Bus. Manage.*, 3: 43-46.
- Razman, M.R., A.S. Hadi, J.M. Jahi, A.H.H. Shah and S. Sani *et al.*, 2009c. A study on negotiations of the montreal protocol: Focusing on global environmental governance specifically on global forum of the united nations environmental programme. *J. Food Agric. Environ.*, 7: 832-836.
- Razman, M.R., A.S. Hadi, J.M. Jahi, A.H.H. Shah and S. Sani *et al.*, 2010. A study on the precautionary principle by using interest approach in the negotiations of the Montreal Protocol focusing on the international environmental governance and law. *J. Food Agric. Environ.*, 8: 372-377.
- Razman, M.R., A.S. Hadi, J.M. Jahi, K. Arifin and K. Aiyub *et al.*, 2009a. The legal approach on occupational safety, health and environmental management: Focusing on the law of private nuisance and International Labour Organisation (ILO) decent work agenda. *Int. Bus. Manage.*, 3: 47-53.
- Razman, M.R., M.B. Mokhtar, S.Z.S. Zakaria, K. Arifin and N.F.A. Bakar, 2014. The process of negotiations towards acceptance of the montreal protocol in Malaysia: Focusing on environmental management. *Information (Japan)*, 17: 1255-1262.
- Razman, M.R., N.H. Nordin, M.B. Mokhtar, S.Z.S. Zakaria and K. Arifin *et al.*, 2015. A study on packaged food safety in Kajang Municipal Council towards food and environmental sustainability. *Information*, 18: 521-536.
- Riyadi, D. and S. Bratakusumah, 2005. [Regional Development Planning]. PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama, Central Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Sedarmayanti, 2001. [Basics of Knowledge About Urban Management]. Mandar Maju. CV, Bandung, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Siagian, P.S., 1987. [Administrative Philosophy]. Ghalia Publisher, Ghalia, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Siagian, P.S., 1991. [Leadership Theory and Practice]. Rineka Cipta, Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Siagian, P.S., 2000. [Management Information System]. Bumi Aksara PT, East Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Sondang, P.S., 2004. [Motivation Theory and Application]. Rineka Cipta, Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).

- Sugiyono, P., 2005. [Understanding Qualitative Research]. Alfabeta Publisher, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Sulaiman, A. and M.R. Razman, 2010. Study on international environmental law and governance: Focusing on basel convention and role of precautionary principle. *J. Food Agric. Environ.*, 8: 1216-1219.
- Syafiie, I.K., 2006. [Public Administration Science]. PT. Rineka Cipta, Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Terry, G.R., 1964. *Principles of Management* Illionis. Richard D Irwin Inc, Homewood, ?Placer,.
- Tjokroamidjojo, B., 1980. [Introduction to Development Administration]. LP3ES Publisher, Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Tjokroamidjojo, B., 1987. [Development Planning]. Haji Masagung, Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Tjokroamidjojo, B., 1994. [Development Planning]. Haji Masagung, Jakarta, Indonesia, ISBN 979-41 2-030-8, Pages: 225 (In Indonesian).
- Wescott, C.G., 2005. E-government and the applications for technology to government services. Master Thesis, Asian Development Bank, Central Jakarta, Indonesia.