The Extent to Which Incentives Influence Primary School Teachers Job Satisfaction in Botswana

C.M. Mhozya
Department of Primary Education, University of Botswana, Botswana

Abstract: A descriptive survey using questionnaires, individual interviews and career histories of primary school teachers was conducted to investigate job satisfaction of teachers as regard to teacher incentives. The study also went further to find out whether there is any link between incentives and gender. Stratified sample from the population of primary school teachers from urban as well as rural areas in Botswana was used. Qualitative data analyses were presented through the use of frequency tables, calculation of percentages and cross tabulations. Information from all sources was triangulated. The study reveals that statistically significant number of teachers were of the view that their salaries were not enough as compared to their workloads. They clearly showed that there were no well set promotion procedures as all progressions depended solely on the school heads recommendation which were confidential and corrupt. The results also showed that teachers did not link, incentives with gender matters instead they ascribed their disadvantages to their poor qualification and hierarchical structures that limits their progression. Three recommendations were made on the basis of the findings.

Key words: Extent, incentives, influence, primary school teachers job satisfaction

INTRODUCTION

Quality education relies mostly on adequate supply of well trained and motivated teachers. Teachers who are committed to their work can do it well. Verdugo et al. (1997) emphasizes that if quality schooling is the goal, the focus should be on developing an organizational climate that permits teachers to perform their duties in a professional and autonomous manner. They should have confidence in the importance of what they are engaged in if they are to perform successfully. If teachers are not satisfied with the work they do they will not perform to their best ability and this may affect productivity. In Botswana primary school teachers have the lowest status as compared to teachers at other levels and this status would appear to affect teachers moral and their work performance. According to Mutorle and Weeks (1994) primary school teachers have a much lower status and receive inferior financial incentives as compared to junior, senior secondary teachers and tertiary lecturers. In 1989, there was a national strike by primary school teachers in Botswana. The reason behind the strike was that they were dissatisfied with the outcome of the job evaluation exercise that took place then. Other similar strikes are even evident to date. Their major grievance is remuneration. In accordance with the 1994 National Commission on Education report and the accompanying government white paper, government now has a policy aimed at raising the qualifications of primary school teachers. As part of the implementation of the policy, candidates with Cambridge certificate were recruited into Primary Colleges of Education. Further more the Ministry of Education through the department of Teacher Training and Development (TT and D) and United Kingdom Department for International Development facilitated the implementation of Primary School Management Development Project (PSMDP) aimed at improving the status of primary school leaders which will in turn improve the quality of primary education in Botswana. Improvements are also evident in teachers' condition of service. The government so far has made improvements through subsidizing medical aid, payments of sick leave and full maternity payments for female teachers, but career structures, promotion opportunities, bonuses and other factors still need to be re-examined carefully. These better working conditions helped attract more teachers into the service. However, conditions of service for primary school teachers especially in rural areas are still appalling. There are still faced with heavy workloads, which include the day to day activities of classroom instruction, extra rural activities and custodian activities. In 2000 a court order instructed Teaching Service Management (TSM) to back pay teachers because of its delay in the implementing of parallel progression for teachers country wide. To date some of the teachers have not benefited from this exercise. A reasonable number of primary school teachers
already have diploma and degrees from the University of Botswana, South Africa and Australia but still do face discrimination when it comes to pay because of their level of operation.

**Purpose of the study:** The purpose of the study, was to assess the job satisfaction of primary school teachers in Botswana. Nothing so far has been done to investigate job satisfaction of primary school teacher. Dissatisfaction with primary school children is blamed on teachers (Education for Kagisano, 1977). It is therefore, important to investigate the factor which contributes to job satisfaction of primary school teachers in Botswana because satisfied teachers can improve the quality of learning to benefit the children. The study will cover the following objectives:

- What are the demographic characteristics of the respondents?
- Are teachers satisfied or dissatisfied with remuneration and promotion prospects?
- Assess whether gender is linked with the status of primary school teaching?

**Significance of the study:** The results of the study is significant to students intending to take up the career of teaching and to lecturers and professionals in identifying factors that contributes to job satisfaction and which renders the profession worth while pursuing as a life time career. The study also is of significance to policy makers in the education system in that it will assist them to devise better conditions of service for teachers. A better condition of service for teachers contributes positively to better education in Botswana. By investigating the job satisfaction of primary schools teachers, the researcher contributes much required knowledge in this under researched area in Botswana.

The recent estimates suggest that more than 5, 000 studies of Job Satisfaction have been published since 1930's. Among the interested researchers worldwide are Gruenberg (1979), Hoy and Miskel (1991, 1996), Conley et al. (1989) and Thompson et al. (1997) reports that the studies cover job satisfaction of school psychologist, education students, elementary and secondary teachers and school custodians. Researchers in educational administration have devoted their great efforts to the study of job satisfaction of administrators and teachers. These investigations are geared towards establishing the relationship between job satisfaction and teacher militancy (Bacharach et al., 1990). Various types of stress show consistent negative relationship with job and career satisfaction. Job satisfaction is said to be lower among elementary school teachers who teach relatively larger groups or classes from different cultural backgrounds (Cranzey et al., 1992). Researchers such as Locke (1976) have indicated that satisfaction with promotion can be viewed as a function of the frequency of promotion in relation to what is desired and the importance of promotion to the individual. As far as the individual is concerned, promotion involves more than recognition of achievement, it can also involve increase in financial reward and status (Gruenberg, 1979). Money is therefore an incentive because it affects the status in which individual is held by others and money can sometimes be measured as a factor in the job satisfaction of people. Praise from supervisors is also valued by employees and has been seen as most frequently cited event that causes either satisfaction or dissatisfaction at the workplace. Improving the extrinsic conditions therefore calls for better teacher salaries, merit pay, career ladders, recognition and reward programs (Louis and Smith, 1990).

In Botswana researchers such as Maphorisa (1987) investigated secondary school teacher’s satisfaction and indicated that they were more satisfied with their work than not satisfied and that demographic characteristics of teachers showed no difference in level of satisfaction with work. Investigation on Junior Secondary school heads satisfaction showed that they were satisfied with factors like achievements, interpersonal relationship and autonomy and were dissatisfied with their work conditions, advancement and salary. Furthermore, a comparisons of Batswana teachers and non Batswana teachers showed more dissatisfaction in the context of their work and that female teachers showed more dissatisfaction as compared to their male counterparts (Mogotsi, 1993), Mautle and Weeks (1994) Burchfield (1992) and Motswakele (1996) investigated teachers schemes and prospects for advancement and found out that teachers favored monetary rewards for excellence of service and high student achievements. They further stated, that customary incentives issues such as starting salaries, increments and housing ranked high. A majority of teachers in Primary school stayed in institutional houses and chances of buying houses were slim. Otimile (1995) found that nurses were dissatisfied with working conditions, organizational requirements peer interaction and pay. Amongst employees in Botswana Seretse (1994) found that intrinsic factors such as challenge and autonomy promote satisfaction as opposed to extrinsic factors which bring about dissatisfaction.

Theories of motivation are associated with job satisfaction. Motivation is seen as the inner drive which
prompts people to act in a certain way (Musaazi, 1982). It is therefore, realized that motivation can come from within the individual and make them act in a certain manner. Maslow’s theory asserts that human beings have five basic needs levels in the hierarchy; namely the physiological level (hunger thirst, touch, etc); safety and security level (protection against hunger and threat, freedom from fear etc), belonging, love and social activities level (belonging to groups, satisfaction associated with others etc); self esteem level (self respect, achievement, competence etc) and self actualization level (achievement of potential and maximum self development) (Musaazi, 1982). These needs are arranged in a hierarchical order. The less pre-potent need are neither desired nor sought until the pre-potent needs are satisfied or fulfilled. Thus the need for safety and security will not produce satisfaction when attained until physiological needs are fulfilled and so on. However, Maslow does not stress that the more pre-potent needs have to be fully satisfied before the less pre-potent operate but that the more pre-potent will always be relatively more satisfied than the less pre-potent one (Musaazi, 1982). Criticisms of this theory have revealed that, there is little firm support for thesis of a fixed hierarchy of needs which automatically governs action. It is not necessarily what a person needs but what individuals’ values that controls their thoughts and actions (Locke, 1976).

Herzberg (1966) produced what is known as the two-factor theory of motivation. The essence is that a factor when positive leads to satisfaction. But, when negative, does not necessarily lead to dissatisfaction. Conversely, the factors when negative leads to dissatisfaction but does not, when positive lead to satisfaction. For example, praise is a powerful motivator, but its absence might not be demotivating. Or just as bad pay demotivates, good pay is simply taken for granted (Mwanalushi, 1992). According to this theory, satisfaction and dissatisfaction are caused by different factors. Satisfaction is results from intrinsic rewards such as achievement, recognition, the work itself, responsibility and achievement while dissatisfaction ensues when something is wrong from the working environment itself (extrinsic rewards) such as pay policy, supervision, salary, working conditions, job security, interpersonal relationship and status at work. Many researchers on the subject have realized that major contributions to the knowledge and understanding of the nature of job satisfaction have been realized (Locke, 1976).

Incentives are seen as a way of improving performances and as a means of enhancing teacher’s motivation and achievement. Incentives facilitate, reinforce and reward specific action (Kenmerer, 1993). In Ghana teachers identified factors such as inadequate or poor salaries, lack of opportunity for advancement in teaching as responsible for the job mobility and less pay (Bame, 1991). Kenmerer (1993) stress that if incentives are used to monitor teacher’s efficacy and efficiency they must be adequate and fair. Monetary rewards are the individual’s desire to satisfy physical needs like food, shelter and clothing or as a symbol of achievement or recognition. Burghfield (1992) undertook a study in Botswana on teachers’ incentives and teachers felt that their rewards were inferior as compared to those of teachers in Junior and Secondary schools. Mautle and Weeks (1994) advanced recommendations of merit pay and rewarding of in-service courses but advancement was not mentioned as a source of either satisfaction or dissatisfaction by school heads in a study on prospects for advancement. Mannathoko (1995) saw Parallel Progression Policy as turning the clock backwards for the teaching profession because of categorizing teachers as technicians not professionals and that teachers saw the policy as distorting their promotion prospects and salaries.

Gender represents the manner in which women and men are differentiated and ordered in a given socio-cultural context. It implies structural relationship of differences, inequality, domination and/or practice between men and women as manifested in education (Mannathoko, 1995). According to Blakemore and Cooksey, women often occupy inferior positions in society, not because they are naturally inferior to men but because of social disadvantages attached to being a women. Grant (1989) pointed out that teaching career was affected by gender dimensions especially because it is associated with women however, there are fewer women in management of educational institution as compared to men. It is therefore important to investigate whether these gender differences exist in primary schools and whether they have any bearing in job satisfaction or dissatisfaction of teachers. It appears however, that Jones (1990) saw that the relationship between gender and satisfaction with pay and work has been at most small in magnitude and fairly inconsistent in direction. Research findings indicated that men move into administrative positions at earlier stages in their career than do women that are with fewer years of teaching experience. This therefore, suggests that more female have fewer years of experience as administrators but have more years of experience as teachers. Clustering of women in fields such as clerical work, nursing, education and other service occupation may drive wages down because the labor supply exceeds the employment demand in these fields (Pounder, 1989). In Botswana for example majority of
female lecturers in teacher education institutions, were in primary school training colleges which were of lower status than secondary level colleges.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Design:** The study was of a descriptive nature and used quantitative design. Questionnaires, interviews and career histories were used for data collection.

**Delimitation:** The study did not cover all primary school teachers in Botswana due to the distances between primary schools and the number of primary schools country wide. However, the sampling was based on both urban and rural areas and male and female teachers which was important for the study.

**Subjects:** The population of interest was derived from primary school teachers employed by the department of Teaching Service Management (TSM) in Botswana. The teachers included in the sample were all permanent. From the 180 teachers selected for the sample only 160 responded. This made a response rate of 89%. To decrease gender bias, the researcher included all the permanent male teachers found in targeted schools in the sample. It is known in Botswana that female teachers dominate in primary schools (more female teachers than male teachers). Ninety-five were females while 63 were male teachers.

**Instrumentation:** One set of questionnaire was used for data collection. The questionnaire was adopted from Mogotsi (1993) and some modifications made to suit the topic at hand. The questionnaire had section A and B. Section A was meant to draw information on teachers demographic data which included teacher’s gender, qualification, teaching experience, location, age and level taught. The information was useful to the study when coming to compare the responses and making conclusions. Section B contained closed ended statements. The statements appeared under two categories namely: Teacher incentives and gender matters. The respondents were to indicate whether they agreed or disagreed with the statements. Individual interviews were self administered by the researcher to 40 teachers (20 female and 20 male) from the same sample of teachers who completed the questionnaires. The information gathered from interviews was analyzed using the same categories from the questionnaire. The researcher also interviewed 4 teachers to obtain their career histories. From the sample there were 2 males and 2 females. The researcher took three weeks to interview the subjects and the information carefully recorded and then analyzed using the categories mentioned in the questionnaires and interviews.

**Data analysis:** The researcher used the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) to design frequency tables and to calculate the percentages for each statement on the questionnaire. The data responses from the questionnaire, interviews and the career history were triangulated.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

**Demographic data:** The demographic data which are reported in this study come from the survey questionnaires, the individual interviews and teacher career histories. The information was on the respondents’ age, location, gender, qualification and teaching experience. A comparison of these demographic characteristics was made where appropriate. A total of 160 teachers filled the survey questionnaires and out of this total 136 teachers were between the ages of 20-39 years. A total of 40 teachers were interviewed and 32 were between the ages of 20-39 years of age. Career histories were taken from a total of 4 teachers and 3 teachers aged between 20-39 years of age. The findings showed that the majority of teachers (60.6%) who responded to questionnaires were from rural areas while the minority (39.4%) was from urban areas. The number of respondents from rural and urban areas who were interviewed and those of career histories balanced due to the fact that the samples sizes were small in number. The number of male and female respondents did not vary much (female-95 male-65) because the researcher wanted to decrease gender bias. Interviews and career histories had 50/50 female and male teachers because of the samples sizes. The majority of teachers (58.8%) had experience of ten years and below while (41.2%) taught for over eleven years. The majority of teachers (86.9%) had Primary Teachers’ Certificate (PTC) and a majority of teachers interviewed and those from the career histories also had PTC. The reason why the majority of primary school teachers have PTC is because since 1975 the only certificate granted by colleges was changed from the earlier designations of Primary High and Primary Low (Yoder and Mautle, 1991). This shows that even though the government had recommended the phasing out of PTC to Diploma so much still remains to be done.

**Teacher incentives:** On whether there were well set promotion procedures in the teaching career the findings from the survey questionnaire indicated that 11% of the respondents agreed while 75.6% disagreed. The reasons
Table 1: Frequencies and percentages of teachers job satisfaction with incentives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>5 (SA)</th>
<th>4 (A)</th>
<th>3 (N)</th>
<th>2 (D)</th>
<th>1 (SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are well set promotion procedures in my career</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are adequate promotional opportunities for me</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My salary is equal to the job I do</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I will not leave the present job for a job of the same salary</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: SA=Strongly Agree, A=Agree, N=Neutral, D=Disagree, SD=Strongly Disagree

provided by respondents emerged from interviews and career histories which clearly showed that there were no well set promotion procedures. Teachers interviewed and those who participated in the career histories were of the view that promotion procedures were not transparent and were corrupt. The study indicated that 15% of teachers agreed that there were adequate promotional opportunities in the teaching career while the majority 66.9% disagreed. With regard to adequate promotional opportunities majority of teachers during interviews and career histories showed dissatisfaction. They indicated that the promotion ladder was narrow in primary schools which make it difficult to progress, that advancement in further education is limited because of limited spaces in the Universities and Colleges of Education in Botswana and that there is back log of teachers who needs further training in primary schools. On whether the salary was equal to the job done, the minority of teachers 3.8% in the survey questionnaire agreed whereas 89.4% disagreed. Teachers during interviews and career histories also felt that their workloads exceeded their pay. Their workloads included pastoral care, lesson preparation and scheme of work, teaching not less than 6 lessons daily, marking about 30 exercises for Mathematics, English and Setswana daily, supervision of extra mural activities to mention a few. All data sources collaborate the findings that an overwhelming majority of teachers were of the view that their salaries were not equal to the job they do. The findings from questionnaires also showed that 43.3% of the teachers agreed that they will not leave teaching for a job of the same salary while 40% disagreed. Responses from interviews and career histories showed that teachers preferred teaching than any job. They mentioned how they enjoyed and liked teaching and working with children, the holiday break and their long service. The findings showed that half of the teachers on the job would not leave teaching because of salary reasons whereas another half would.

The generic findings on teacher incentives showed that the teachers expressed dissatisfaction with their promotional opportunities and procedures as well as remuneration (Table 1). Teachers felt that there was corruption when it comes to promotions. This was due to the fact that procedures were not transparent and this made it difficult for them to support the current promotion procedures. Conley et al. (1989) indicated that lack of opportunities for promotion has less impact on teachers' attitudes than unfair promotion process. According to Mokete (1995) teaching career has low promotion prospects and hence is not likely to be an attractive life long career. He further stated that there was need to improve the status of teachers within schools. Regarding remuneration the findings agree with those of Maphorisa (1987) that salaries were sources of dissatisfaction among teachers. This was also emphasized by Burchfield (1992) who undertook a study on teachers' incentives and primary school teachers felt that their rewards were inferior as compared to those of junior, secondary school and tertiary teachers. Mautle and Weeks (1994) advanced recommendations of merit pay and rewarding of in-service courses.

**Gender matters:** Under this study the focus was on whether gender is linked to the status of primary school teaching.

The survey questionnaire findings showed that 26.3% of teachers agreed while 60.6% disagreed that the salaries in primary schools are linked to gender matters (Table 2). The findings corroborate with responses from the interviews and career histories of teachers involved that gender matters have not influenced the salary scales instead they linked it to lack of awareness of policy makers with regard to teachers workloads and attitudes of people towards teaching at primary level. In responding to whether male teachers progress in teaching more than female teachers 26.9% agreed while 58.1% disagreed from the survey questionnaire. From individual interviews and career histories, teachers disagreed that male teachers progressed in teaching more than female teachers. The findings however, contradict with the fact that the Department of Primary Education (MOE) is dominated by male who are former teachers and most of them occupying higher position compared to female teachers.
Table 2: Frequencies and percentages of teachers job satisfaction with regard to gender matters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>5 SA</th>
<th>4 A</th>
<th>3 N</th>
<th>2 D</th>
<th>1 SD</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Salaries in primary schools are low because majority of teachers are women</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>13.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male teachers in primary schools progress in teaching more than female teachers</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: SA-Strongly Agree, A-Agree, N-Neutral, D-Disagree, SD-Strongly Disagree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Teachers general opinions were that the status of primary school teaching, the remuneration as well as progression of teachers were not linked at all with gender matters. Teachers felt that these maybe ascribed to other reasons such as poor qualification of primary school teachers, lack of knowledge of workload of teaching and the hierarchical structure in primary schools that makes progression limited. Teacher’s perception however contradicts those from researchers such as Pounder (1988) whose findings show that the clustering of women in fields like education may drive wages down. Marnathoko (1995) also argued that the feminization of primary education lowers its status and therefore, its condition of service. She further stated that the reason for primary school teachers gender blindness maybe due to the fact that they lack information with regard to the feminization of primary school teaching and how it affects salaries. In essence the interpretation of the results might be that teachers lack adequate information and that they are gender blind.

CONCLUSION

The purpose of this study, is to provide the reader with the conclusions of the study and to make recommendation based on the findings which might be useful to policy makers, educational administrators, researchers’ and students on issues of job satisfaction in primary schools. The conclusions will be presented according to the sub topics of the study.

Demographic characteristics: The finding from the demographic data shows that the sample used is representative of primary school teachers in Botswana. There were more female as compared to male and more teachers from rural areas than from urban areas. There were also less experienced teachers than experienced, younger teachers than older teachers and more teachers with Primary Teachers Certificate than those with other qualification.

Teacher incentives: Despite the fact that teaching is having low status as compared to other careers, teachers felt that teaching was enjoyable. This shows that teachers are intrinsically motivated as compared to extrinsic motivation such as high pay, progression and promotion. This shows that intrinsic motivators are as important as extrinsic ones. This is also confirmed by Frase (1989) in his study which confirmed that intrinsic rewards were proved to be more powerful than extrinsic rewards.

Gender matters: Although the majority of teachers (60%) of teachers perception s show that they think that there is no link between gender and the low status of primary schools, the study shows that a quarter 26.3% of teachers do think that gender can be linked to the low status of primary school teaching. The teachers of this minority view argue that the low status of teaching must be ascribed to factors that include gender relations. It is plausible that there are elements inadequate information, gender stereotypes and gender blindness which led teachers unaware of factors related to gender matters.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Ministry of Education should carry out more detailed satisfaction policy and program with the view of narrowing the gap of payments and incentives given to teachers via other civil servants in Botswana. This can be done through awarding teachers for work well done and identifying expert teachers and sending them to other schools to specialize in their areas.
- The Department of Teaching Service Management to review the teacher’s scheme of service to improve the career advancement of teachers. This can be through periodic courses conducted during holidays and awarded certificates.
- The in-service and pre-service coordinators should include in their program gender issues so that teachers may understand how it relates to their career.

REFERENCES


