

## Determination of Aflatoxin M<sub>1</sub> Level in Milk and White Cheese Consumed in Ankara Region, Turkey

<sup>1</sup>Buket Er, <sup>1</sup>Burak Demirhan, <sup>2</sup>Fatma Kaynak Onurdag and <sup>1</sup>Gulderen Yentur  
<sup>1</sup>Department of Food Analysis,  
<sup>2</sup>Department of Pharmaceutical Microbiology, Faculty of Pharmacy,  
Gazi University, 06330 Etiler Ankara, Turkey

**Abstract:** In this study, total number of 220 milk and cheese samples were analysed, consisting 120 pasteurised milk samples from 8 different firms, 30 raw milk samples and 70 Turkish white brined cheese samples from 7 different firms which were collected from Ankara region, Turkey. Aflatoxin M<sub>1</sub> (AFM<sub>1</sub>) was determined with an Enzyme Linked Immunosorbent Assay (Elisa) using the I'screen Afla M<sub>1</sub> ELISA kit. Sample preparations were done according to the instructions of the Tecna kit. Mean levels of AFM<sub>1</sub> was 0.025±0.003 ppb in the milk samples. Regarding the Turkish white brined cheese samples, mean level of AFM<sub>1</sub> was found to be 0.023±0.004 ppb. The data revealed that while mean AFM<sub>1</sub> levels found in pasteurised milk of two firms were higher than Turkish Food Codex (TFC) values for the other milk was within TFC values. In raw milk and cheese samples all the AFM<sub>1</sub> levels were within the TFC.

**Key words:** Aflatoxin, white cheese, ELISA, milk samples, TFC, Turkey

---

### INTRODUCTION

Milk is a source of many nutrients like proteins and calcium and consumed as a main food in many countries. However, milk could also be a source of aflatoxin M<sub>1</sub> (AFM<sub>1</sub>) and humans, especially infants and young children who consume contaminated milk and milk products are at high risk for AFM<sub>1</sub> toxin (Karimi *et al.*, 2007; Yapar *et al.*, 2008). Aflatoxins are toxic and carcinogenic metabolic products of *Aspergillus* (*A. flavus*, *A. parasiticus* and *A. nomius*) (Kim *et al.*, 2000; Gurses *et al.*, 2004; Ozdemir, 2007; Tajik *et al.*, 2007; Yapar *et al.*, 2008; Nuryono *et al.*, 2009). Aflatoxin M<sub>1</sub> (AFM<sub>1</sub>) occurs on food and feed during growing, harvesting and storage. Aflatoxin contamination may occur after ingestion or contamination of milk and milk products with fungi (Celik *et al.*, 2005; Ozdemir, 2007). As a result of ingestion of feed stuffs by the animal, aflatoxin B<sub>1</sub> (AFB<sub>1</sub>) may occur in milk and dairy products. After AFB<sub>1</sub> ingestion, it can be converted to hydroxylated form, AFM<sub>1</sub> and can be detected in milk after 12-24 h (Lopez *et al.*, 2003; Gurses *et al.*, 2004; Tajik *et al.*, 2007; Ozdemir, 2007).

Aflatoxins are highly toxic, mutagenic, teratogenic and carcinogenic compounds (Yentur *et al.*, 2006). Although AFM<sub>1</sub> is less mutagenic than AFB<sub>1</sub>, it is

also known to be carcinogenic and classified by the International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC, 1993) as 2nd class carcinogen Lopez *et al.*, 2003; Karimi *et al.*, 2007; Tajik *et al.*, 2007; Yapar *et al.*, 2008; Nuryono *et al.*, 2009). AFM<sub>1</sub> is resistant to thermal inactivation; therefore, it is stable after pasteurization. The process of milk to cheese also results in disregarded destruction of AFM<sub>1</sub>. Thus, if raw milk contains AFM<sub>1</sub>, cheese made from such milk will also contain AFM<sub>1</sub> (Lopez *et al.*, 2003; Gurses *et al.*, 2004; Sarimehmetoglu *et al.*, 2004; Yaroglu *et al.*, 2005; Ozdemir, 2007). Since, liquid pasteurised milk and cheese are being consumed by various age groups and especially infants, determining the AFM<sub>1</sub> in these products is important to protect consumers and it is an important public health concern (Franco *et al.*, 1998; Mohamadi *et al.*, 2009).

In European countries the maximum level of AFM<sub>1</sub>, should not exceed 50 ng kg<sup>-1</sup> for liquid milk and milk products. In USA, the AFM<sub>1</sub> level should not be greater than 500 ng kg<sup>-1</sup> in milk. In Turkey, according to the Turkish Food Codex, limits for AFM<sub>1</sub> are 50 ng L<sup>-1</sup> (0.05 ppb) and 500 ng L<sup>-1</sup> (0.5 ppb) for milk and cheese, respectively (Anonymous, 2008). AFM<sub>1</sub> level can be determined by chromatographic methods in milk and milk products (Franco *et al.*, 1998; Aycicek *et al.*, 2005). Although, these methods are reliable methods, they are

expensive and lengthy. In recent days, Enzyme Linked Immunosorbent Assay (ELISA), a simple, cheap, sensitive and quick method is preferred in routine work (Gurses *et al.*, 2004; Karimi *et al.*, 2007; Tajik *et al.*, 2007; Ghiasian *et al.*, 2007). In the study it was aimed to determine AFM<sub>1</sub> levels in raw milk, pasteurised milk and Turkish white brined cheese samples consumed in Ankara region, Turkey with ELISA method.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

Total 220 milk and cheese samples; consisting 120 pasteurised milk samples from A, B, C, D, E, F, G, H firms, 30 raw milk samples (I) and 70 Turkish white brined cheese samples from J, K, L, M, N, O, P firms were investigated in case of AFM<sub>1</sub> levels. Raw milk samples were collected from open air markets, pasteurised milk and cheese samples were collected from supermarkets in Ankara region. Samples were carried to laboratory in a cold chain for the detection of AFM<sub>1</sub>. AFM<sub>1</sub> was determined with an ELISA using the I’screen AFLA M<sub>1</sub> ELISA kit (TECNA S.r.l., Trieste, Italy) (Tajik *et al.*, 2007; Anonymous, 2008) Sample preparations were done according to the instructions of the TECNA kit.

The kit was stored at 4°C and all the reagents were brought to room temperature, 2 h before use and all reagents were returned to 4°C after use. Milk samples were refrigerated and centrifuged at 2-8°C for 10 min at 3000×g. The fat from the skimmed milk was separated and the skimmed milk was used.

The cheese samples were weighted and 2 g of the samples were used. About 15 mL of dichloromethane was added to the sample and extracted by shaking the vial for 15 min. The suspension was filtered and 3.75 mL of the suspension was transferred to a glass tube and evaporated at 60°C under a nitrogen stream.

The residue was dissolved in 750 µL of the extraction solution and mixed by vortex for 1 min. After then, 750 µL hexane was added and vortexed for 1 min. The suspension was centrifuged for 15 min at 2000×g. The upper hexane layer was removed and 50 µL of the methanolic/aqueous phase was taken and 200 µL dilution buffer was added. This final suspension was used in the test.

The AFM<sub>1</sub> standards and milk samples were added to 96 wells microplate coated with AFM<sub>1</sub> antibodies and incubated for 45 min at room temperature. The kit reagents consisting of the enzyme conjugate solution, developing solution and stop solutions were added to the wells, respectively and washed several times in the appropriate order and incubation times according to the instructions. The absorbance was measured at 450 nm.

**Statistical analyses:** Student’s t-test and One Way ANOVA test were conducted for statistical evaluation (Daniel, 1991).

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The levels of AFM<sub>1</sub> in pasteurised milk, raw milk and cheese samples were determined. The concerning values are shown in Table 1-3. The results of the analyses were evaluated within the Turkish Food Codex. Table 1 shows that the mean level of AFM<sub>1</sub> was 0.025±0.003 ppb in the milk samples. The maximum and minimum levels were determined as 0.26 and 0.0, respectively.

The aflatoxin mean level of D and H firm were found higher than the Turkish Food Codex Standard value (0.05 ppb). The mean levels of the aflatoxin M<sub>1</sub> in pasteurised milk of other firms and raw milk were found within the Turkish Food Codex Standard value. The differences between mean levels of aflatoxin M<sub>1</sub> in these samples and the TFC values were statistically significant (p<0.001).

Table 2 shows that the level of average AFM<sub>1</sub> was 0.023±0.004 ppb in the Turkish white brined cheese samples. The maximum and minimum levels were determined as 0.24 and 0.0, respectively. The mean levels of the AFM<sub>1</sub> in all of the samples were found within the Turkish Food Codex (TFC) Standard. The difference between the mean levels of AFM<sub>1</sub> in all of the cheese samples and the TFC values (0.5 ppb) were found statistically significant (p<0.001). This TFC value (0.5 ppb)

Table 1: Statistical analysis for level of AFM<sub>1</sub> (ppb) in milk samples

Samples	n	X±SE	Min.	Max.	p
A	15	0.006±0.001 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.01	*
B	15	0.041±0.007 <sup>bc</sup>	0.00	0.12	*
C	15	0.012±0.003 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.04	*
D	15	0.060±0.017 <sup>e</sup>	0.01	0.26	*
E	15	0.026±0.003 <sup>b</sup>	0.01	0.04	*
F	15	0.017±0.003 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.04	*
G	15	0.016±0.003 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.04	*
H	15	0.056±0.015 <sup>e</sup>	0.01	0.20	*
I	30	0.007±0.001 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.03	*
Total	150	0.025±0.003	0.00	0.26	

\*p<0.001 (the difference between the levels of aflatoxin M<sub>1</sub> was found statistically significant amongst the groups)

Table 2: Statistical analysis for level of AFM<sub>1</sub> (ppb) in cheese samples

Samples	n	X±SE	Min.	Max.	p
J	10	0.017±0.004 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.04	*
K	10	0.008±0.003 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.03	*
L	10	0.066±0.023 <sup>b</sup>	0.01	0.24	*
M	10	0.014±0.003 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.03	*
N	10	0.014±0.003 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.04	*
O	10	0.021±0.004 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.05	*
P	10	0.018±0.004 <sup>a</sup>	0.00	0.03	*
Total	70	0.023±0.004	0.00	0.24	

\*p<0.001 (the difference between the levels of aflatoxin M<sub>1</sub> was found statistically significant amongst the firms)

**Table 3: Levels of AFM<sub>1</sub> in pasteurised milk, raw milk and cheese samples**

Type of sample analysed	No. of sample	<0.05 ppb	0.05-0.09 ppb	0.1-0.24 ppb	0.25-0.3 ppb	Percentage
Pasteurised milk	120	105	7	7	1	12.5*
Raw milk	30	30	0	0	0	-
Turkish white brined cheese	70	65	2	3	0	-

\*Exceeding TFC standard value

was for AFM<sub>1</sub> in terms of risky food stuffs. The data revealed that the mean levels of AFM<sub>1</sub> found in milk samples of A, B, C, E, F, G firms and raw milk (I) were within the TFC standard values. However, the AFM<sub>1</sub> mean level of D and H firm were found higher than the TFC standard value. Furthermore, the AFM<sub>1</sub> mean levels determined in all of the cheese samples were within the TFC value. Levels of AFM<sub>1</sub> in pasteurised milk samples, raw milk samples and cheese samples are shown in Table 3.

The aflatoxin levels in the milk and cheese samples were differing from each other surveys performed in Turkey. Celik *et al.* (2005) have analysed a total of 85 pasteurised milk samples with ELISA and they have determined that in 27 samples AFM<sub>1</sub> level was determined to exceed the Turkish Food Codex levels (Celik *et al.*, 2005). Kirecci *et al.* (2007) have reported that in 18 fresh milk samples of total 20 samples investigated, AFM<sub>1</sub> level was higher than the acceptable levels according to the Turkish Food Codex. These findings have higher rates than our study. Gurbay *et al.* (2006) have investigated a total of 27 commercial milk samples collected from supermarkets in Ankara and analysed for AFM<sub>1</sub> and they have reported that in only 1 sample AFM<sub>1</sub> level was over the permissible level of European Countries as well as in Turkey. Gurbay *et al.* (2006) reported only one sample contaminated with AFM<sub>1</sub>. The reason for this low rate is thought to be because of the milk samples were mostly UHT milk samples.

The AFM<sub>1</sub> level in milk samples has been investigated in several countries. Dashti *et al.* (2009) have studied with 321 milk samples in Kuwait. Of these samples 177 were fresh milk samples and it had reported that all fresh milk samples except one were contaminated with AFM<sub>1</sub> ranging from 4.9-68.7 ng kg<sup>-1</sup> and eight samples were reported to exceed the European Unions regulatory limit (Dashti *et al.*, 2009). Nuryono *et al.* (2009) have investigated AFM<sub>1</sub> levels in 113 fresh milk in Indonesia and although 65 samples were found to be contaminated with AFM<sub>1</sub>, none of the samples exceeded the European Limit levels (Nuryono *et al.*, 2009). Karimi *et al.* (2007) have investigated 110 pasteurised milk samples, obtained from Iran, in case of AFM<sub>1</sub> levels and AFM<sub>1</sub> was found in 100% of milk samples. They have determined that about 5.4% of the samples had AFM<sub>1</sub> greater than maximum tolerance limit (0.05 µg L<sup>-1</sup>) accepted by European Union

(Karimi *et al.*, 2007). Tajik *et al.* (2007) investigated 72 raw milk and 72 pasteurised milk samples and detected 9 raw milk samples exceeded the level of European Union and none of the pasteurised samples exceeded this limit (Tajik *et al.*, 2007). In the study all the raw milk samples none of the samples exceeded the European Limit levels as well as TFC values. This finding is in accordance with Nuryono *et al.* (2009) however, Dashti *et al.* (2009) and Tajik *et al.* (2007) have found that 4.5 and 12.5% of the raw milk samples exceeded the levels, respectively. In pasteurised milk samples we have determined that 15 samples (12.5%) are contaminated with AFM<sub>1</sub> in an unacceptable level according to TFC. Karimi *et al.* (2007) have also studied pasteurised milk and 4.5% of the samples were exceeding the limit values.

The AFM<sub>1</sub> level in the milk was significantly affected by the geographical region, the country and the season (Sarimehmetoglu *et al.*, 2004). The differences in our results could be because of these reasons. In the process of milk to cheese, AFM<sub>1</sub> insufficient destruction was reported in literature. Thus, cheese was thought to be a potential risk hazard as well as milk and we have studied Turkish white brined cheese samples that are consumed widely in Turkey. Ardic *et al.* (2009) have studied with 193 Turkish white brined cheese samples and 51 samples were detected to have higher AFM<sub>1</sub> than the acceptable limit (Ardic *et al.*, 2009). Sarimehmetoglu *et al.* (2004) have investigated AFM<sub>1</sub> in cheese samples by ELISA and of the 400 cheese samples in 110 samples, the AFM<sub>1</sub> level was reported to be higher than the limits of the Turkish Food Codex. About 100 of the 400 samples were Turkish white cheese samples and they have determined that 27% of the white cheese samples had higher AFM<sub>1</sub> levels than the acceptable levels of the Turkish Food Codex (Sarimehmetoglu *et al.*, 2004). Aycicek *et al.* (2005) have determined the aflatoxin levels in some dairy and food products consumed in Ankara region and in a total of 223 samples, they have investigated 94 samples of white cheese. In 12 white cheese samples, the AFM<sub>1</sub> were higher than the acceptable limits of Turkish Food Codex (Aycicek *et al.*, 2005). Kirecci *et al.* (2007) have investigated 20 white cheese samples determined that 4 samples had higher AFM<sub>1</sub> than the acceptable limit (Kirecci *et al.*, 2007). Gurses *et al.* (2004) have studied with 23 white cheese samples of total 63 cheese samples and determined that 9 of the white cheese samples were AFM<sub>1</sub> positive (Gurses *et al.*, 2004). Yapar *et al.* (2008) investigated the AFM<sub>1</sub> levels in different type of cheese

produced in Turkey. Of the cheese samples, 25 samples were Turkish white cheese samples and in 7 of the Turkish white cheese samples, AFM<sub>1</sub> level was determined to exceed the Turkish Food Codex levels (Yapar *et al.*, 2008). Yaroglu *et al.* (2005) have analysed 200 white cheese samples for AFM<sub>1</sub> level and 2 samples were reported to have higher AFM<sub>1</sub> levels than the acceptable levels of the Turkish Food Codex (Yaroglu *et al.*, 2005).

The literature available on the occurrence of aflatoxins in cheese indicates higher levels of contamination however; the findings are in accordance with Yaroglu *et al.* (2005). Researchers from different countries have also investigated AFM<sub>1</sub> in cheese samples. Kamkar (2005) has studied the presence of AFM<sub>1</sub>, using the thin layer chromatography in Iranian feta cheese samples and of the 80 samples analyzed, 82.5% were found to be contaminated with AFM<sub>1</sub>. (Torkar and Vengus, 2008) have studied in Slovenia with 40 cheese samples and they have determined that 4 samples were contaminated with AFM<sub>1</sub> and concluded that AFM<sub>1</sub> presence in Slovenian cheese does not represent a serious risk for human health (Torkar and Vengus, 2008).

The differences in the results are thought to be because of following reasons. The AFM<sub>1</sub> levels in the cheese significantly affected by cheese manufacturing procedures, different milk contaminants, type of cheese, conditions of cheese ripening and the analytical methods employed (Sarimehmetoglu *et al.* 2004).

### CONCLUSION

In the study 70 cheese samples from 7 different firms were investigated and in none of the samples AFM<sub>1</sub> levels exceeding the TFC values were determined, thus these cheese samples does not represent a risk for public health. Raw milk samples were obtained from 3 different open air markets and an unacceptable value was not determined but this finding should be supported with more number of samples. However, in pasteurised milk 12.5% of the samples exceeded the TFC standard value and are thought to be an important risk for public health especially for infants that are consuming large amounts of milk.

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This study was supported by a grant from Gazi University Research Foundation (Project no: 02/2009-16).

### REFERENCES

Anonymous, 2008. A flatoxin B1 and M1 Erisim adresi. Erisim Tarihi, pp: 25.

- Ardic, M., Y. Karakaya, M. Atasever and G. Adiguzel, 2009. Aflatoxin M1 levels of Turkish white brined cheese. *Food Control*, 20: 196-199.
- Aycicek, H., A. Aksoy and S. Saygi, 2005. Determination of aflatoxin levels in some dairy and food products, which consumed in Ankara, Turkey. *Food Control*, 16: 263-266.
- Celik, T.H., B. Sarimehmetoglu and O. Kuplulu, 2005. Aflatoxin M1 contamination in pasteurised milk. *Vet. Arhi.*, 75: 57-65.
- Daniel, W.W., 1991. *Biostatistics: A Foundation for Analysis in the Health Sciences*. 5th Edn., John Wiley and Sons Inc., New York.
- Dashti, B., S. Al-Hamli, H. Alomirah, S. Al-Zenki, A.B. Abbas and W. Sawaya, 2009. Levels of aflatoxin M1 in milk, cheese consumed in Kuwait and occurrence of total aflatoxin in local and imported animal feed. *Food Control*, 20: 686-690.
- Franco, C.M., C.A. Fente, B.I. Vazquez, A. Cepeda, G. Mahuzier and P. Prognon, 1998. Interaction between cyclodextrins and aflatoxins Q1, M1 and P1 Fluorescence and chromatographic studies. *J. Chromatogr. A*, 815: 21-29.
- Ghiasian, S.A., A.H. Maghsood, T.R. Neyestani and S.H. Mirhendi, 2007. Occurrence of aflatoxin M1 in raw milk during the summer and winter seasons in Hamedan, Iran. *J. Food Safety*, 27: 188-198.
- Gurbay, A., S. Aydin, G. Girgin, A.B. Engin and G. Sahin, 2006. Assessment of aflatoxin M1 levels in milk in Ankara, Turkey. *Food Control*, 17: 1-4.
- Gurses, M., A. Erdogan and B. Cetin, 2004. Occurrence of aflatoxin M1 in some cheese types sold in Erzurum, Turkey. *Turk. J. Vet. Anim. Sci.*, 28: 527-530.
- IARC, 1993. *Some Naturally Occurring Substances: Food Items and Constituents, Heterocyclic Aromatic Amines and Mycotoxins*. IARC Monographs on the Evaluation of Carcinogenic Risks to Humans Vol. 56, International Agency for Research on Cancer, Lyon, France, pp: 245-395.
- Kamkar, A., 2005. A study on the occurrence of aflatoxin M1 in raw milk produced in Sarab city of Iran. *Food Control*, 16: 593-599.
- Karimi, G., M. Hassanzadeh, M. Teimuri, F. Nazari and A. Nili, 2007. Aflatoxin M1 contamination in pasteurized milk in Mashhad, Iran. *Iranian J. Pharm. Sci.*, 3: 153-156.
- Kim, E.K., D.H. Shon, D. Ryu, J.W. Park, H.J. Hwang and Y.B. Kim, 2000. Occurrence of aflatoxin M1 in Korean dairy products determined by ELISA and HPLC. *Food Additives Contam.*, 17: 59-64.
- Kirecci, E., M. Savasci and A. Ayyildiz, 2007. Detection of aflatoxin M1 in milk and cheese products consumed in Sarikamis, Turkiye. *Turk. J. Infect.*, 21: 93-96.

- Lopez, C.E., L.L. Ramos, S.S. Ramadan and L.C. Bulacio, 2003. Presence of aflatoxin M1 in milk for human consumption in Argentina. *Food Control*, 14: 31-34.
- Mohamadi, H., M. Alizadeh, J. Rahimi and S. Qasri, 2009. Assessment of aflatoxin M1 levels in selected dairy products in north-western Iran. *Int. J. Dairy Technol.*, 10.1111/j.1471-0307.2009.00559.x
- Nuryono, N., A. Agus, S. Wedhastri, Y.B. Maryudani, S.F.M.C. Setyabudi, J. Böhm and E. Razzazi-Fazeli, 2009. A limited survey of aflatoxin M1 in milk from Indonesia by ELISA. *Food Control*, 20: 721-724.
- Ozdemir, M., 2007. Determination of aflatoxin M1 levels in goat milk consumed in Kilis Province. *Ankara Üniv. Vet. Fakültesi Dergisi*, 54: 99-103.
- Sarimehmetoglu, B., O. Kuplulu and T.H. Celik, 2004. Detection of aflatoxin M1 in cheese samples by ELISA. *Food Control*, 15: 45-49.
- Tajik, H., S.M.R. Rohani and M. Moradi, 2007. Detection of aflatoxin M1 in raw and commercial pasteurized milk in Urmia, Iran. *Pak. J. Biol. Sci.*, 10: 4103-4107.
- Torkar, K.G. and A. Vengus, 2008. The presence of yeasts, moulds and aflatoxin M1 in raw milk and cheese in Slovenia. *Food Control*, 19: 570-577.
- Yapar, K., M. Elmali, A. Kart and H. Yaman, 2008. Aflatoxin M1 levels in different type of cheese products produced in Turkey. *Medycyna Weterynaryjna*, 64: 53-55.
- Yaroglu, T., H.H. Oruc and M. Tayar, 2005. Aflatoxin M1 levels in cheese samples from some provinces of Turkey. *Food Control*, 16: 883-885.
- Yentur, G., B. Er and G.M. Ozkan, 2006. Determination of aflatoxins in peanut butter and sesame samples using high-performance liquid chromatography method. *Eur. Food Res. Technol.*, 224: 167-170.