

Prevalence of Racism and Exploitation of Pakistani Immigrant Workers in the Workplace in Ireland an Exploration of the Role of Social Work with Pakistani Immigrant Workers

Shahbaz Khan

Department of Social Welfare and Women Development, Punjab, Pakistan

Abstract: Relationship between racial prejudices with the exploitation of Pakistani migrant workers in the Irish workplaces was studied by conducting four case studies including one female in Dublin, Ireland. Findings of the case studies demonstrated the prevalence of racial prejudice in the Irish workplaces leading to exploitation of Pakistani migrant workers. Mostly, the Irish employers/supervisors were reported to be harsh, using derogatory language and showing resentment while dealing with them. In addition to the denial to their legally entitled holidays employers were used to detain the migrant workers for long unpaid working hours. Most of the time the employers charged the renewal charges of their work permits unlawfully. Their discrimination while nominating for on job sponsored training opportunities was also their serious concern that hindered the chances of their promotion and increments in salary. However, the arbitrary and discretionary powers of the Irish employers/supervisors, dependency for the renewal of their work permits and inability to communicate in English language were the major reported reasons of their exploitation. Further, they were not familiar with any Pakistani organization rendering social work services for their guidance and protection of their legal rights and privileges in the work places but they desired such services.

Key words: Racism, exploitation, immigrant workers, anti-oppressive social work

INTRODUCTION

Racism has been considered a problematic issue in Irish workplaces as immigration levels has increased^[1]. Rapid economic growth and shortage of indigenous labor created space to accommodate a significant strength of people entering the Irish labor market from overseas. During the recent years an influx of immigrants into Irish workplaces has led to problems associated with racism that sparked the incidences of their exploitation at the hands of their Irish employers^[2]. According to the Chief Executive of the Equality Authority, more than 20% of the Authority's caseload under the Employment Equality Act, 1998 involved complaints of racial discrimination. This reflects alarming concerns of the immigrant workers warranting the second highest area of casework after gender-based discrimination^[2].

Racial discrimination includes cases like access to employment, working conditions, harassment, dismissal and equal pay/wages^[3]. Despite being unlawful racism is prevalent at the workplaces. It may be direct, subtle, conscious or unwitting. Normally, it comes from employers, managers, and supervisors and also from other members of the workforce^[4].

Racism at the workplace manifests itself in a wide range of ways including, being overlooked for promotion,

denied training, unfair selection for difficult or unpleasant tasks, being called names, being the butt of jokes, verbal harassment or sustained unfriendly contact or exclusion^[1]. Of significant concern is the number of cases where migrant workers are not provided with the same pay and working conditions as their Irish colleagues^[5]. The effects of racism can make victims fearful of going to work, forcing them to leave their employment and causing physical or psychological illness^[6].

The main objectives of the present study were to:

- Explore the experiences of racism of immigrant workers prevalent in Irish workplaces;
- Examine the nature of their exploitation at the hands of their employers, managers and supervisors;
- Explore the nature of the social work services rendered by the various organizations working for the immigrant workers; and,
- Capture the nature and the scope of social work interventions which were needed to mitigate racial discrimination and the exploitation of immigrant workers in the workplace.

The focus of the present study was to explore how the prevalence of racism could lead to the exploitation of

Pakistani immigrant workers in the Irish workplaces of any trade in Ireland. Secondly, how did they experience the social work services rendered by the agencies working in Ireland for the mitigation of racial discrimination and exploitation in workplaces? And lastly, what type of social work services did they need to escape from the effects of racism and exploitation in the workplace?

Rationale: Due to the recent increase of immigrants from various regions of the world Irish society was experiencing increasing racial diversity that was perceived as a threat to the indigenous population^[1]. Particularly increasing were the instances of racial discrimination and exploitation of immigrant workers in Irish workplaces. This posed a serious threat to the smooth running of business enterprises. The incidents of strikes and peaceful protests of immigrant workers demanding equal rights in workplaces were appearing in media reports^[2]. Some of the trade unions were playing the role of watchdog organizations to protect the immigrant workers from racial discrimination and exploitation^[3]. Such a situation might not be a healthy sign for any growing economy like the Irish one. Especially, in the context of the future demands and dependency on an immigrant workforce, racial discrimination and exploitation of immigrant workers might hinder the inflow of labour from overseas.

Given this context, it was timely to investigate how the prevalence of racism led to the exploitation of immigrant workers in Irish workplaces. Immigrant workers with different socio-cultural background and racial origin have different approaches and experiences of racism. Therefore, it was necessary to explore their specific experiences of racial discrimination and exploitation in workplaces with reference to their socio-cultural peculiarities. This study was revealed the immigrant community specific needs of social work interventions.

Relevance with social work: Anti-racist workplace approach necessitates the interventions of social work services in the workplaces. Initiatives to make the workplaces free from discrimination and harassment, welcoming relationships between the employers and workers, accommodating attitudes towards cultural and racial diversity and promoting equality and addressing the vulnerability of migrant workers in the workplaces are the emerging needs of the workplaces in Ireland. Counselling of employers, managers and supervisors may pave the way to promote multiculturalism and coexistence of employers and migrant workers with racial diversity in Irish workplaces. The findings of the study based on the analysis of qualitative data may also provide a guide to workable and efficient social work intervention to address the emerging needs of Pakistani immigrant workers. Their

experiences of racial discrimination in workplaces may provide empirical and workable guidelines to shape such social work interventions which might be equally applicable to immigrant workers from different racial origins.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Universe of Study: All the Work Permit holder Pakistani immigrant workers (both male and female) employed by Irish employers in Ireland were the population of the present study. Following were the qualifications of the respondents:

- Working with valid immigrant work permits issued to the Irish employer(s) or whose work permits had been expired and the same were under process for renewal by the same Irish employer(s).
- Working in any trade in Ireland.
- Already worked under the Irish employer(s) and were working with non- Irish employer.

Case Studies: Qualitative research design using, the case study method, was adopted to conduct the present research. In-depth interviews of a small sample of four (4) Pakistani immigrant workers fulfilling the qualifications of the respondents for the present research and working in Ireland were conducted by using the semi-structured elaborated Interview Guide. Detailed qualitative data was gathered from the respondents. It provided an opportunity to grasp all the possible aspects of the research questions with the qualitative understanding providing background explanation of the issues under study.

Context : The issue of racism and racial discrimination has emerged as a considerable social, legislative and political concern in the contemporary Irish society^[10]. This growing concern about racism has also been reflected both in media and in the increasing number of empirical research studies conducted in Ireland^[9]. Presently, an effort has been made to offer a substantial review of the research evidence that is currently available on racism with special reference to the exploitation of migrant workers in Irish workplaces^[11]. It draws attention to the major issues in relation to policy and practice needed to meet the emerging needs of the minority ethnic population in the light of their experiences of racial discrimination and exploitation in workplaces

Population of ethnic minorities: Irwin and Dunn^[12] conducted a detailed study focused on four minority ethnic communities i.e. Pakistanis, Indians, Chinese and

Travelers. Irwin and Dunn's estimates of the size of the Indian, Pakistani and Irish Travelers communities appeared to broadly confirm the 'best estimates' for these groups that were available. The majority of the Pakistani community migrated from all over Pakistan but mainly from the Punjab, Azad Kashmir and Northern West Frontier Province^[12]. In addition, research is also emerging on other minority groups including refugees and asylum seekers in Ireland^[13].

Economic activity and occupational distribution: There are significantly higher proportions of Pakistani and Indian communities engaged in professional and managerial occupations. This largely reflects their salaried/employment status working in various workplaces of enterprises. However, it is also noted that a small but significant minority of the Pakistani community are experiencing prolonged unemployment i.e. up to 7 per cent^[12].

Racism: Racism will be considered a process whereby members of social groups categorize members of other groups as different or inferior on the basis of real or imagined physical or cultural characteristics, and which serves the purpose of legitimating inferior treatment, exclusion or exploitation^[14].

Racism in contemporary use is a belief that humans are sub-divided into hereditary groups that are innately different in their social behaviour and capacities that can be ranked as superior or inferior. These judgements are subsequently used to legitimate the unequal distribution of the society's resources, specifically, various forms of wealth, prestige and power^[15].

Racial discrimination : The International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, (ICERD) defined racial discrimination as:

- any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference based on race, color, descent or national or ethnic origin, which has the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing the recognition, enjoyment or exercise, on an equal footing, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural or any other field of public life^[14].

Discrimination in employment can be said to occur when migrant/ethnic minorities are accorded inferior treatment in labor market or in the workplace relative to nationals despite being comparably qualified in terms of education, experience or other relevant criteria.

Migrant Workers: Kelly^[16] quoted the definition of migrant worker of 1990 UN Convention on the Protection of all Migrant Workers and their Families as: A person, who is to be engaged, is engaged or has been engaged in remunerated activity in a State of which he or she is not national. According to this definition those migrant workers who may currently be out of work but have already worked in the host State also fall into the category of migrant workers. Operationally, this definition has been adopted for the Pakistani migrant workers in Ireland under the work permit system of Ireland for the present study.

Work Permits: Work permits are issued to the employers only on temporary basis for a maximum of 12 months. The work permits are renewable indefinitely on a yearly basis on submitting application to the Department of Enterprise, Trade and Employment. The cost of renewal of work permit is borne by the employer and, the no objection certificate (NOC) about the non-availability of an Irish national employee is also a precondition for the issuance/renewal of the work permit. The migrant worker cannot change his trade of employment other than the specified in the work permit issued to his employer^[16].

Exploitation : According to Blau^[17], exploitation means unfair rate of exchange in which super-ordinate tries to give minimum return of subordinate's services and this rate of exchange is usually against the prevalent social norms.

- If, however, the demands of ruling group with a Monopoly of vital resources far exceed what social norms define as fair and just, subordinates will feel exploited and seize any opportunity to escape the ruling group's power or to oppose it, in as much as their situation is basically no different from that of group's subject to coercive force^[17].

PREVALENCE OF RACISM

Following were taken as the indexes of the prevalence of racism

- Refusal to co-operate with people from different racial groups
- Racist comments, ridicule or abuse (verbal or written)
- Discriminatory policies and procedures
- Non-inclusive curriculum or training practices
- Physical assault and sexual harassment

Refusal to co-operate with people from different racial groups: Although the migrant worker is entitled to seek material information from his employer for making complaints about the incidents of physical or sexual harassment, yet under law the employer enjoys discretion to provide such information. Therefore, it is a matter of employers' preferences either to cooperate with the migrant worker or not^[18].

Racist comments, ridicule or abuse (verbal or written): Perceptions about the migrant workers as being different from the native Irish nationals are occasionally making their plight more deplorable in Irish workplaces. Comments like go back to your own country are also made by the Irish employers^[9]. Under the Public Order Act, 1994 and the Prohibition of Incitement to Hatred Act, 1989 the racist behaviors depriving people of their basic human rights, dignity and respect are prohibited^[9]. Despite of all the legislative prohibitions the incidents of racist abuse of immigrant workers reflect their intolerant behavior.

The U.S. Department of State^[20] published a report on the issues of human rights in Ireland and reported the situation of racial discrimination of migrant communities and migrant workers. Accordingly, 78% of the migrant respondents of the survey conducted by an NGO reported their experiences of racism ranging from verbal slur to physical harassment both in public and in workplaces.

Discriminatory policies and procedures: The organizational policies and procedures with zero tolerance for racism are the pre-requisite of a whole organization approach. Organizational policies and procedures reflecting anti-racial behavior and attitude in the workplaces may ensure the high degree of retention of immigrant workers. It must be reflected in the staff contracts, in disciplinary codes and management actions while dealing with migrant workers in Irish workplaces. The attitudinal and behavioral elements in workplaces include adding new positive conditions, preserving existing positive conditions, avoiding new negative conditions and eliminating existing negative conditions^[21].

Non-inclusive curriculum or training practices: Along with other factors the high turnover of the migrant workers has been attributed to the lack or inadequate job specific training, absence of induction/orientation programmes and failure to accommodate cultural or religious diversity^[21].

Physical assault and sexual harassment: Physical abuse like beating, hair pulling and spitting on face, racist and disregarding name-calling are reported as a likely

practice in the work places. Women normally complain about their experiences of sexual harassment and abuse like actual, threatened or attempted rape^[9].

Racial prejudice and racist harassment towards ethnic minority communities is no larger an uncommon phenomenon in Irish society. Irwin and Dunn^[12] found that 76% of the population recognized that it was illegal to discriminate on the basis of 'race'. There was significant misunderstanding in terms of the legislation. A sample of companies surveyed found that only 25% considered it illegal to discriminate in employment, 9% in housing and 7% in education. Only 25% of the general population was aware of the existence of an organization that dealt with cases of racial discrimination^[22].

More generally, racist harassment has been found to take place in a variety of contexts including schools, houses and the workplaces. Overall, it is evident there was both a significant degree of ignorance and lack of understanding about the needs and concerns of minority ethnic people as well as a worrying level of prejudice against them.

EXPLOITATION OF MIGRANT WORKERS

Various watchdog organizations are addressing the issues of exploitation of immigrant workers in Ireland. The Irish Congress of Trade Unions has a number of concerns in relation to the Work Permit scheme that arised from the fact that the work permit was held by the employer and not by the employee. This could make workers vulnerable to exploitation particularly as the employee was aware that the permit needs to reapply for by the employer each year. Statistics from the Department of Enterprise Trade and Employment showed that of the 40,321 work permits that were issued in 2002 only 16,562 were renewals^[4].

Indicators of exploitation of migrant workers: Following were taken as the indexes of the exploitation of migrant workers:

- Avoiding information dissemination about the employment conditions -Terms of Employment
- Unnecessary commissions and deductions from salary
- Violation of the legal terms and conditions of employment
- Harsh working conditions.
- Hindering the process of redressing grievances

Avoiding information dissemination about the employment conditions-terms of employment: Under Employment Permits Act, 2003 employers are legally

required to provide the migrant worker/employee with a written statement reading the necessary details of the terms and conditions of their employment and any change therein from time to time within the two months of the commencement of employment. In case of violations in this regard the employee concerned may complain to a Rights Commissioner^[24]. The majority of migrant workers do not know the required legal information governing their work permit and relationships with their employers. They even do not have access or information about the free information services provided by the State^[16].

Unnecessary commissions and deductions from salary: Except for the legal normal taxes on their income, under the Irish law the migrant workers are not required to pay any fee or commissions regarding their recruitment to the employers or any recruitment agency. The employer is responsible to pay the fee for either obtaining or renewing the work permits of the migrant workers^[1,16,24].

Violation of the legal terms and conditions of employment: Employers are not paying proper wages and are threatening to have visas revoked if workers complain to the authorities. According to The Equality Authority^[18] a mountain of complaints have been received that rogue employers are not paying proper wages to these workers. In some cases, foreign workers have been told that their visas and work permits would be revoked if they would complain of receiving low wages^[20].

Harsh working conditions: Migrant workers are subjected to work for long hours from 10 to 14 hours per day^[9]. According to Kelly^[16] the plight of women migrant workers is very deplorable. They are subjected to poor working and living conditions, below minimum wages, lack of clarity about re-contract difficulty in practicing religion or adhering to cultural traditions of choice. Many Filipino nurses are being paid 30% less than their Irish equivalents and forced to live five or six to a bedroom. Health Boards have not been exonerated of some guilt in this. Cases of threats of deportation issued to nursing employees who objected to working 18 hour shifts without any meal breaks were also reported^[26].

Hindering the process of redressing grievances: Many employers frequently threaten the migrant workers to be deported in case of challenging or complaining about the instances of their exploitation^[9]. The inability of the employers/management to fulfill their responsibilities while dealing with the cases of harassment or sexual harassment may also reflect their hindrances in redressing the grievances of the

aggrieved migrant workers^[18]. Collins^[3] noted an alarming increase in migrant workers seeking assistance addressing their problems related to their exploitation by their employers in workplaces in Ireland.

NEEDS OF IMMIGRANT WORKERS FOR SOCIAL WORK SERVICES FAMILIARITY WITH ORGANIZATIONS RENDERING SOCIAL WORK SERVICES

According to City Bridges-The Information Booklet almost 64 trade unions were working for the migrant workers throughout the Ireland. More than 734,840 migrant workers had voluntarily joined these trade unions relevant to their trade/industry or sector of employment.

Nature of the needed social work services: City Bridges-The Information Booklet revealed that the trade unions are mainly concerned with helping the migrant workers in the issues like:

- Negotiating agreements with employers on pay and working conditions,
- Defending the rights of workers,
- Ensuring fair treatment,
- Fighting discrimination,
- Giving practical support and advice on workplace issue

THEORY AND PRACTICE THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This research draws its theoretical foundations from Williams (1996) theory of Power, Difference and Conflict as quoted by Williams^[25] and Blau's^[17] theory of Dependency and power. Both of the theories explained the power relations leading to an evaluation of difference and inequality influencing the exchange of services and valuable resources available in society. Accordingly, social constructionist formulations acknowledge the social differentiation by utilizing the concepts of domination and the patterning of exploitation. Given this context, power relations are central to anti-oppressive practice approach in social work. Its focus is on competency leading to manage diversity by proclaiming difference as essential element of distinguishing need and responses. Need is technical activity for change^[27].

According to Blau^[17] the fulfillment of expectations establishes an order in process of social exchange. Sometimes this exchange is not according to the fair rate as expected. Such a situation may create a threat to social

and moral norms. This very often happens in a situation where services are needed by a particular group of people whereas the others do not desire such services. Such a contrary situation compels the subordinate to accept the reward given by the super-ordinate. Such a pattern of exchange does not enable people to get their expectations fulfilled and due reward of their services. This unfair rate of exchange according to Blau^[17] is termed as exploitation. Accordingly exploitation may take place in two ways:

- People feel that the reward they get is far below what they expect
- The people controlling services get more work done as compared to reward.

Anti-oppressive Social work practice: Social workers operating from an anti-oppressive framework maintain an analysis of human behavior that considers the influence of social institutions and structures. Accordingly, the main focus of anti-oppressive practice is linking personal realities to societal structural contexts of race, gender, ability, class and age. For example, Bishop^[28] identifies visibility as a significant factor in how oppression and domination are experienced. Anti-oppressive practice assumes that all forms of oppression and domination are interrelated. It also acknowledges that each form is unique and is expressed differently. Hooks^[29] uses the analogy of a house to describe this relationship pointing out that all forms of oppression and domination share the same foundation, but are unique, like the rooms in a house.

Defining anti-oppressive practice: The term anti-oppressive practice is generally understood as an umbrella term that encompasses a variety of practice approaches including, but not limited to, radical, structural, feminist, anti-racist, critical, and liberatory frameworks^[30,35]. These approaches seek to challenge and change expressions of oppression and domination and to maximize the potential of social work to promote social justice.

For Dominelli^[36] anti-oppressive social work is a form of social work practice, which addresses social divisions and structural inequalities in the work that is done with 'clients' (users) or workers. Anti-oppressive practice aims to provide more appropriate and sensitive services by responding to people's needs regardless of their social status. Thompson^[37] contended that as an anti-discriminatory approach social work practice seeks to reduce, undermine or eliminate discrimination and oppression, specifically in terms of challenging racism, ageism, and disablism and other forms of discrimination encountered in social work. Anti-discriminatory practice

is an attempt to eradicate discrimination from interpersonal interactions and institutional structures in which people operate.

Difference, identity and oppression: Difference and identity are very closely connected. The failure to acknowledge an individual's unique identity implies the assumption that in order to be equal, people must be the same. Anti-oppressive practice maintains that equality is not based on similarity. For example, Hooks^[26], in the context of discussing racism, states that the notion that differences of skin color, class background, and cultural heritage must be erased for justice and equality to prevail. It is a brand of popular false consciousness that helps keep racist thinking and action intact. Anti-oppressive practice assumes fundamental equality among social groups, but stresses that equality is not synonymous with sameness^[38,43].

Social work and social justice: Social justice includes a vision of society in which the distribution of resources is equitable and all members are physically and psychologically safe and secure. It is envisioned as a society in which individuals are both self-determining (able to develop their full capacities), and interdependent (capable of interacting democratically with others). Social justice involves social actors who have a sense of their own agency as well as a sense of social responsibility toward others and the society as a whole^[44].

In Ireland, prevalence of racism provides sufficient justification to the Irish employers to exploit the immigrant workers in Irish workplaces. Immigrant workers holding work permits depend on their employers for the continuity and security of their employment. Therefore, they normally compromise on their exploitative status in Irish labour market. Given this context, the needs of social work services of Pakistani migrant workers may be identified to combat racial discrimination and their exploitation in Irish workplaces.

LESSONS LEARNED

The Review of the aforementioned empirical studies reflected the following prominent racial concerns of the minority ethnic communities:

- The language barrier limited the chances of getting integrated in local population and benefit from various social and employment services;
- Racial discrimination prevailed both in the general society and in workplaces
- The lack of services for capacity building of the minority ethnic communities, particularly the migrant workers with work permit.

- The low number of cases of reporting racial discrimination and exploitation of migrant workers in the workplace due the fear of loss of their employment and denial of renewal of their work permits by their employers.
- Incidents of physical and sexual harassment are no exception to the exploitation of migrant workers in the workplaces.
- There has been an alarming increase in pleas for assistance.
- 'Leave to remain' is the major worry of the most of the immigrants. The category 'Leave to Remain' is huge and comprises persons whose work permit is not renewed because they have lost their job or been made redundant.

RESULTS

Four case studies were conducted including one female respondent. Accordingly the salient findings had been summarized as follows:

- Irish employers and supervisors were invariably reported to be racist. They did not hesitate to use abusive language while addressing the Pakistani migrant workers. However, educated Irish people were polite and treated Pakistani migrant workers in more civilized ways.
- Normally, the Irish employers and colleagues of the Pakistani migrant workers did not like to mix up with them. They were not allowed to talk in their native language in the workplaces. Color of skin was given importance. The Irish disliked brown skin color of the Asians. They placed all the Asians in the same racial category due to their brown skin color.
- Religious background of Pakistani migrant workers had impact on the dealing of the Irish employers and supervisors. Christian Pakistani migrant workers were treated more friendly as compared to the Muslim ones. However, the Irish employers and supervisors discriminated and exploited Pakistani migrant workers regardless their age and sex. A female Pakistani migrant worker reported being abused and humiliated just because of her racial background.
- Pakistani migrant workers working in managerial positions had also experienced racial discrimination in the workplaces. However, their senior Irish officers did not use offensive and abusive language with them. Their overt behavior seemed to be friendly but they treated Pakistani managerial staff differently as compared to their Irish colleagues in assigning odd duties and offering incentives/rewards.
- The Irish employers and supervisors kept the

Pakistani migrant workers under pressure and never appreciated them even if they worked for long hours and showed good performance. However, sometimes the supervisors unnecessarily taunted them on very petty issues of omissions or faults. On the other hand their Irish colleagues had been rarely shown displeasure.

- Pakistani migrant workers were always preferred to assign menial and difficult tasks which the Irish workers were not ready to do. But they were always denied the opportunities of any paid training courses.
- Prolonged working hours, denial of paid weekly and public holidays and non-recognition of their good performance were the major concerns of the Pakistani migrant workers. They were aware of their exploitation in the workplaces but they felt helplessness due to their dependency on their Irish employers and supervisors for getting and renewal of their work permits.
- The complaints of the Pakistani migrant workers almost went unnoticed. Their Irish employers and supervisors discriminate against the Pakistani migrant workers only in matters where they enjoy discretionary powers.
- The Pakistani migrant workers were under the constant feeling of job insecurity. They had to accept and comply with all the orders of their employers and supervisors to ensure the continuity of their job. Otherwise they apprehended that their work permits might be revoked.
- The Pakistani migrant workers were more concerned with the attitudinal issues reflecting the hatred of their Irish employers and supervisors, for example, their social exclusion and humiliation and non-recognition of their services.

DISCUSSION

Qualitative data of this research reflected the experiences of racial prejudice and exploitative treatment of the respondents representing the different sectors of the labor market in Ireland. Inclusion of one female in case studies provided an opportunity to understand the issue of racism and workers' exploitation in the workplace in gender perspective. However, gender differences among the migrant workers showed no impact on the manifestations of racial and exploitative behavior of the Irish employers and supervisory staff. However, the position of the migrant workers in the organizational hierarchy of the large international corporations/formations had a little impact on the overt and offensive expression of racism in the workplaces. On

the whole Irish employers and supervisory staff were reported to be significantly racist and exploiting the migrant workers. The balance of power favored the Irish employers/supervisor due to the dependency of the migrant workers on them for getting or renewal of their work permits.

CONCLUSIONS

Almost all the respondents reported their unequal treatment in the work places as compared to their Irish co-workers. Their Irish employers and supervisory staff manifested racist behavior both overtly and covertly. They were not treated equally just because of being racially different.

However, the level of education of the employers or their own past experiences of immigration in UK and America had positive impact on the racist attitude of the Irish employers. The highly educated Irish people were reported polite in dealing with migrants regardless of their racial background. Similarly the Irish with their own past experiences of immigration in UK and America were also reported to be friendly with migrant workers.

This study also explored that the Irish employers just threatened to revoke the work permits of the migrant workers but actually they hardly did so. Actually, they readily issued and got renewed the work permits of most of the respondents of this study. The reason was reported that migrant workers were more submissive and they used to comply with all the orders of their bosses without any resistance. They readily performed all the types of menial jobs for what the Irish workers were not ready to do.

Further, almost all the respondents reported that their bosses used their harsh behavior as a tool to keep them under pressure so that they might engage them for longer working hours, assign them more difficult and menial tasks and deprive them from their due rights and privileges in the workplaces. Migrant workers happened to be a cheap labor force in Ireland. Therefore, regardless their racial prejudice the Irish employers usually did not want to lose their migrant workers. Basically, the control of the Irish employers on issuance and renewal of work permits was reported to be the only major reason putting the migrant workers in vulnerable circumstances in the workplaces. That is why the migrant workers had to tolerate the incidences of racial discrimination and exploitation in the workplaces without showing any resistance. Invariably all the respondents reported that English language was the major barrier for establishing meaningful communication and interaction with the Irish employers, supervisors and even the clients in the workplaces. While performing their duties the Pakistani migrant workers may not fully understand the instructions of their employers and supervisors. Consequently, there are ever chances that they could not comply with those

instructions properly. This may create souring relationships among them. Therefore, Pakistani migrant workers may be offered opportunities to learn English language. Their ability to speak read and write English may empower them to communicate with their Irish employers, supervisors and even the clients more effectively. They may be capable to deal with the legal and financial matters related to their job like salary, duties, legal entitlements and the legal means to solve their problems in the workplaces.

The job specific training of Pakistani migrant workers seems to be very crucial component of their job performance. Usually, they had no previous experience of the job to perform. It may lead to their eventual omissions and commissions while performing their duties causing souring relationships with their employers and supervisors. It was found that the respondents were almost deprived from availing the opportunities of on job training. Therefore, it may be suggested that Irish employers and supervisors may be convinced to provide sufficient training to their migrant workers. It may not only enhance the performance of the workers but also improve their working relationships with their Irish employers and supervisors.

All the respondents reported that their hard work, commitment and dedication with their job almost went unnoticed. Their employers never appreciated their performance nor had they been treated equal to their Irish colleagues. The respondents pointed out that they had always been assigned difficult and menial assignments but never have been considered for awarding any type of incentives. They had to work for longer hours and even on Saturday and Sunday (weekly paid holidays) but it went without recognition and compensation. It shows the uncomfortable relationships among the Pakistani migrant workers and their Irish employers.

Given such circumstances the services of social worker may be introduced in the following areas:

- Establishing meaningful communication between the Pakistani migrant workers and their Irish employers,
- Providing guidance to Pakistani migrant workers to submit their representations to the authorities concerned in cases of racial discrimination and exploitation in the Irish workplaces,
- Playing mediatory role to assist both the migrant workers and the Irish employers/supervisors for maintaining productive and comfortable relationships,
- Providing counseling and guidance services to both the Pakistani migrant workers and their Irish employers/ supervisors to understand the institutional and cultural constraints hampering their workable and comfortable relationships,

- Assisting the Pakistani migrant workers and the Irish employers to deal with the concerned agencies for issuance and renewal of the work permits,
- Arranging orientation and training programs for the capacity building of the migrant workers in collaboration of various agencies concerned,
- Keeping liaison with various government and non-government organization working for migrant workers to seek help for Pakistani migrant workers, and,
- Extend informational and referral services to the Pakistani migrant workers enabling them to solve their problems in the Irish workplaces.
- Pakistani social worker may be employed by any of the leading governmental or non-governmental organizations to play an enabling and facilitating role to solve the workplace related problems of Pakistani migrant workers. The services of a professionally qualified Pakistani social worker might be helpful for maintaining workable and trustworthy relationships between the Irish employers and the Pakistani migrant workers. He may perform a mediatory role to assist both the Irish employers and Pakistani migrant workers to resolve the issues related to racist discrimination and the exploitation of the migrant workers in the workplaces.

REFERENCES

1. MacEinri, P., 2003. Labour Migration into Ireland, Dublin, Immigrant Council of Ireland.
2. Dobbins, T., 2001. Tackling Racism at the Workplace, Ireland, Industrial Relations News, Dublin ,IRN Publishing . <http://www.irn.ie/>
3. Collins, D., 2003. Government action called for on exploitation of immigrant workers, *Cork*, Irish Examiner, 9 th June.
4. McGrill, P. and O. Quintim , 2002. A wake-call on race: Belfast, A report for the Equality Commission of Northern Ireland
5. Social Industrial Professional and Technical Union, 2003. Representing Immigrant Workers- A Guide for Union Representatives , Dublin. Siptu. www.siptu.ie
6. Gillespie, T., 2001. Employers treat foreigners as slave labour, *Cork*, Irish Examiner, 8th May <http://archives.tcm.ie/irishexaminer/2001/05/08/ireland.asp>.
7. MacEinri, P., 2001. Immigration into Ireland: Trends, Policy Responses, Outlook (draft at <http://migration.ucc.ie/irelandfirstreport.htm>) first part of research project for EU Commission Contract VS/2000/0312 February-December 2001 "Governance models and new migration patterns: local strategies to foster social cohesion in a changing labour market". <http://migration.ucc.ie/irelandfirstreport.htm>)
8. Socialist Voice, 2004. A Monthly News Paper of Socialist Party, No.74,Dublin, Socialist Voice. www.socialistparty.net/pub/pages/voicearc.htm
9. Migrant News, 2003. A News Paper, Issue 1: Dublin. Migrant Rights Centre Ireland .
10. The Irish Commission for Justice and Peace, 2002. Refugees and Asylum Seekers- A Challenge to Solidarity, Dublin, Irish Commission for Justice and Peace.
11. The Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform, 2004. First National Report by Ireland: United Nations International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination,
12. Irwin, G. and S. Dunn, 1996. Ethnic Minorities in Northern Ireland .Coleraine, University of Ulster, Centre for the Study of Conflict.
13. Warm, D., 1998. The Jews of Northern Ireland, In: P. Hainsworth (ed.) *Divided Society: Ethnic Minorities and Racism in Northern Ireland* , London, Pluto Press.
14. Wrench, J., 1997. Migrants and ethnic minorities at the workplace, Esbjerg ,South Jutland University Press.
15. Marger, M.N., 1994. *Race and Ethnic Relations: American and Global Perspectives*, Geneva,The United Nations.
16. Kelly, N., 2004. Work Permits in Ireland-A Recommendation for Change, Dublin, Migrant Rights Centre Ireland.
17. Blau, P.M., 1964. *Exchange and Power in Social Life*, New York, John Wiley and Sons, Inc.
18. The Equality Authority, 2002 . *Sexual Harassment and Harassment at Work*, Dublin ,The Equality Authority.
19. Know Racism, 2001. *What You Can Do Against Racism: Dublin* ,The National Anti-Racism Awareness Programme.
20. The U.S. Department of State, 2003. *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices 2003*. Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor
21. National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism, 2003. *Guidelines for Developing a 'Whole Organization' Approach to Address Racism and to Support Interculturalism*, Dublin ,National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism.
22. Human Rights Commission, 2003. *Promoting and Protecting Human Rights in Irish Society*, Dublin , Human Rights Commission.
23. Leonard, P., 2001. The future of critical social work in uncertain conditions. *Critical Social Work*, 2, (1). Retrieved February 8, 2002, from <http://www.criticalsocialwork.com>, Dublin ,The Stationary Office.

24. Kenny, C., 2003. Handbook on Immigrants, Rights and entitlements in Ireland, Dublin, Immigrant Council of Ireland.
25. Conroy, P., 2002. Migrant Workers and Their Experiences ,Dublin, Ralaheen.
26. Irish Examiner, 2001. Exploitation of immigrant workers gives lie to welcoming image, Cork, Irish Examiner, 6th April.
27. Williams, C., 1999. 'Connecting Anti-racist and Anti-oppressive Theory and Practice: Retrenchment or Reappraisal'? *British J. Social Work*, 29, pp: 211-230.
28. Bishop, A., 1994. *Becoming an ally: Breaking the cycle of oppression* ,Halifax ,Fernwood Publishing.
29. Hooks, B., 1995. *Power, passion and pedagogy*, Boston, Shambhala Sun, pp: 27-34.
30. Bailey, R. and M. Brake, 1975. *Radical social work*, New York ,Pantheon Books.
31. Dominelli, L., 1988. *Anti-racist social work*, London, MacMillan.
32. Dominelli, L. and E. McLeod, 1989. *Feminist social work*, London, MacMillan.
33. Fook, J., 2002. *Social work Critical theory and practice*, London, Sage Publications.
34. Leonard, P., 2001. The future of critical social work in uncertain conditions. *Critical Social Work*, 2, Retrieved 8, 2002, from <http://www.criticalsocialwork.com>
35. Moreau, M., 1993. *Empowerment II: Snapshots of the structural approach in action*, Ottawa ,Carleton University Press. National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism, 2003. Guidelines for Developing a 'Whole Organization' Approach to Address Racism and to Support Interculturalism, Dublin ,National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism.
36. Dominelli, L., 1998. Anti-oppressive practice in context. In R. Adams, L. Dominelli and M. Payne. (Eds.), *Social Work: Themes, Issues and Critical Debates* , London, , MacMillan. pp: 3-22
37. Thompson, N., 1993. *Anti-discriminatory practice*, London, MacMillan .
38. Brotman, S. and S. Pollack, 1997. The problem of merging post modernism with feminist social work, *Canadian Social Work Review*, 14 pp: 9-22.
39. Brown, C., 1994. Feminism, postmodernism, and the challenges of diversity. In A. Chambon and A. Irving (Eds.), *Essays on Postmodernism and Social Work* , Toronto, Canadian Scholars Press, pp.33-44.
40. Chambon, A., 1994. Postmodernity and social work discourse(s): Notes on the changing language of a profession. In A. Chambon and A. Irving, *Essays on postmodernism and social work*, Toronto,, Canadian Scholars Press, pp: 63-75.
41. Epstein, L., 1994. The therapeutic in contemporary society. In A. Chambon and A. Irving. *Essays on postmodernism and social work* ,Toronto, Canadian Scholars Press, pp: .5-20.
42. Irving, A., 1994. From image to simulacra: The modern/postmodern divide and social work. In A. Chambon and A. Irving, *Essays on postmodernism and social work* , Toronto, ,Canadian Scholars Press, pp: 21-34.
43. John, L., 1994. Borrowed knowledge in social work: An introduction to post- structuralism and postmodernity. In A. Chambon ., and A. Irving. *Essays on postmodernism and social work* ,Toronto, Canadian Scholars Press, pp: 49-62.
44. Adams, M., L.A. Bell and P. Griffin, 1997. *Teaching for diversity and social justice: A sourcebook* , London, Routledge.