

Prostitution and Public Policy in the Surabaya City of Indonesia: Formulation and Implementation

Wahyu Wibowo, Brodjol Sutijo Suprih Ulama, Sri Pingit Wulandari,
Sri Mumpuni Retnaningsih, Destri Susilaningrum, Lucia Aridinanti,
Mutiah Salamah, Mike Prastuti, Noviyanti Santoso and Iis Dewi Ratih
Institut Teknologi Sepuluh Nopember, Surabaya, Indonesia

Abstract: The study aims to explore and describe the best practice of local government policy formulation for the effort of prostitution eradication which is the closure of prostitution located at the Jarak-Dolly, Surabaya, East Java, Indonesia and is expected to be a reference for handling prostitution problems in developing countries. The research approach uses qualitative with case study type. Data collection techniques used was in-depth interviews, focus group discussions and document collection. The data analysis technique applied interactive model. The results of this study indicate that there are six advantages of policy formulation from Surabaya municipal government, i.e., support mobilization both vertical, horizontal and cross dimensional, different socialization approach based on target group, adequate compensation for the target group, the clearance and dismissal of homesteads to be functioned as municipal asset, sustainable community empowerment activities both before and after the closure of the localization. The package of Surabaya municipal government policy is more socio-economic-empowering and different from other countries that generally use a repressive-law approach. In addition, the role of local government in this policy was very dominant and different from other countries that are generally carried out by the central government.

Key words: Prostitution eradication, local government, policy formulation, interactive model, socialization approach, empowerment activities

INTRODUCTION

This study aims to explore and describe the policy formulation of the closure Jarak-Dolly localization by the Surabaya municipal government and the best practice for handling prostitution in developing countries. Prostitution is one of the most prevalent problems in big cities including Surabaya as one of the metropolitan cities in Indonesia. Prostitution activity in Surabaya is centred on several localizations such as Dupak Bangunsari, Tambakasri, Sememi, Moroseneng, Klakah Rejo and Jarak-Dolly. Among the several localizations, the largest is the Jarak-Dolly where located at Putat Jaya urban village, sub-district of Sawahan. In 2012, the number of sex workers whom recorded by the Dinas Sosial Surabaya (Surabaya Social Service Office, hereafter, Source) data reached 2117 people with the number of homesteads recorded as 625 units. From this report, 51.01% of the sex workers and 49.92% of the homesteads are located at the Jarak-Dolly localization. The percentage indicates that the Jarak-Dolly is the localization with the largest number of the sex workers and homesteads in Surabaya. This localization is estimated to have existed since the 1960's

and there are some sources stated that it was the largest localization in Southeast Asia (Faizal, 2014a, b). The large number of the sex workers and homesteads affect the economic rotation in the localization IDR 300-500 million (US\$ 25,000-US\$ 42,000) per night. The sex workers per month reached IDR 10-13 million (US\$ 850-US\$ 1,100) (Lestari, 2014). The big money turnover was the result of an average of 3 thousand overnight visitors at Jarak-Dolly localization. This large economic turnover causes the growth of other (non-prostitution) businesses that depended on localization activities such as laundry, beauty shop, tailor, grocer, parking service, etc. Recorded approximately 14,000 people (excluding the sex workers and pimps) depended on localization activities with total turnover of the entire economy every night reaching IDR 2 billion or about IDR 60 billion per month (Nurqomar, 2012).

On the other hand, the existence of large-scale Jarak-Dolly localization also has major negative effects such as spreading of the sexually transmitted disease, human trafficking and negative influences on the behaviour of surrounding communities, especially, the younger generation. The situations affected the Surabaya

municipal government intending to reduce and eradicate prostitution activities by establishing and implementing Local Regulation No. 07 of 1999 on the prohibition of the use of buildings/places for immorality and binding to perform immoral acts. This regulation is the basis for Surabaya municipal government to control and close the localization in Surabaya. In 2013, the Surabaya municipal government succeeded in closing down three localizations: Dupak Bangunsari, Moroseneng and Sememi (Faizal, 2014b). By the closing of these three localizations, the city of Surabaya was left only by the Jarak Dolly localization.

The large number of the sex workers, pimps, homesteads, economies of scale and people who were dependent on the existence of the Jarak-Dolly have caused this localization to have a very complex problem, resulting in the efforts of the Surabaya municipal government to implement the Local Regulation No. 07 year, of 1999 to close the Jarak-Dolly localization was more difficult. Even feared there would be chaos when this closing policy was applied. The factors that inhibit among others were as follows.

The number of the sex workers, pimps, homesteads and societies that were economically dependent on the Jarak-Dolly localization activities were large enough so that numbers of people who reject the closure of it were also large. The existence of political support by one of the political parties where the Jarak-Dolly Region is an “enclave” of the vote of the political party. As a matter of fact, political support was also committed by some officials, both in the executive (government of Surabaya) and legislative (DPRD Surabaya) (Yakub, 2017).

Despite the closure of the Jarak-Dolly had great obstacles to be undertaken but the Surabaya municipal government kept issuing a closure policy. It was an initiation of an executive led by the Mayor of Surabaya. On June 18, 2014 the Jarak-Dolly localization was officially closed with a declaration of its contents as follows:

- Supporting Putat Jaya urban village is a clean, healthy, safe, orderly and free area of prostitution
- Supporting Putat Jaya urban village as a dignified territory by establishing economic enterprises in accordance with religious guidance
- Requesting the authorities to crack down on traffickers of crimes against trafficking, immoral acts and the use of the homesteads for immoral acts according to applicable laws
- Supporting Putat Jaya urban village as an advanced, safe and orderly area with guidance and attention of the security apparatus of the Surabaya municipal, East Java Province and National governments (Wibowo, 2014)

The concerns about a chaotic situation at the closure did not occur. The closure of Jarak-Dolly localization was relatively conducive. Given the complexity of the problems, the strength of rejection and the extent of the obstacles, the success of closing the Jarak-Dolly localization was the evidence of the two points as follows.

The seriousness of the Surabaya municipal government to implement the policy that has been formulated previously. Even in this case, the Surabaya municipal government was the initiation of the closure. The maturation of policy formulation conducted by Surabaya municipal government. The closure of Jarak-Dolly localization that was predicted to cause chaos had not been proven since all lines and aspects have been touched by the policy package prepared by the Surabaya municipal government.

The description shows that the Surabaya municipal government’s policy of closing the Jarak-Dolly localization can be regarded as best practice for prostitution problem solving of big cities, especially in developing countries. Best practice is worth reviewing more in-depth using the perspective of public policy.

In the most common language, Dye (2008) defines public policy as “whatever government chooses to do or not to do”. The definition contains two important aspects firstly that public policy is related to what the government decides or sets, so in this case, public policy can be interpreted as a result of a decision or a series of decisions. The second is the manifestation of the decision. A decision can be manifested by concrete action or even through neglect/no-action. In the case of localization in Surabaya, the government has Regional Regulation No. 07 of 1999 as a product of decision/determination about Surabaya municipal government urge to eradicate prostitution practices. This decision was then responded by concrete action through the formulation of various policies to close the Jarak-Dolly localization. The policy which adopted by the Surabaya municipal government was certainly different from the policies pursued by other local governments. There were even local governments that choose neglecting (not to do) for prostitution and localization practices.

Another expert, Anderson (2006) defines public policy as “a relatively stable, purposive course of action followed by an actor or set of actors in dealing with a matter or matter of concern”. Anderson’s view is clearer in determining the so-called limits of policy, namely on what has become the direction and actions of the government. In the Jarak-Dolly phenomenon, the so-called directions and actions are Regional Regulation No. 07 of 1999 and the Surabaya municipal government’s

action to close. The definition of Anderson is also clearer in expressing the purpose of enacting public policy as the existence of public problems. Similar to this statement, Knoepfel *et al.* (2007) also states that “all policies aim to resolve a public problem”. The policy of closing Jarak-Dolly localization by the Surabaya municipal government was a concrete step to overcome the public problem of the Jarak-Dolly localization as previously described, the spreading of the sexually transmitted disease, human trafficking and the negative influence on the behaviour of the surrounding community, especially to the younger generation.

The public policy is a long process that includes several stages. Ripley as quoted by Subarsono (2008, 2009) mentions that there are 5 stages of public policy comprising the preparation of the agenda, formulation and legitimacy, implementation and evaluation. The agenda setting phases are related to how to build perceptions among stakeholders that a phenomenon is really considered a problem, create boundary problems and mobilize support. In the Jarak-Dolly context, the arrangement of this agenda is an attempt at how the Surabaya municipal government affirms that the existence of the Jarak-Dolly has a large negative effect. Furthermore, the Surabaya municipal government raised support for the closing discourse of the Jarak-Dolly localization. There were many elements of society that support the closing discourse, although, there were also some who refuse.

The stage of policy formulation and legitimacy related to the collection of information related to problems encountered, developing policy alternatives and selection of alternatives which then made policy. Anderson (2006) also reveals that policy formulations are related to how to develop options or alternatives to solve problems and who participates in the formulation. As for Michael and Ramesh (1995) states that, policy formulation is the process of formulating policy choices by the government. After reviewing the issues raised and the closing discourse supported by most elements of society, the Surabaya municipal government formulated the steps and actions required to close the Jarak-Dolly localization. These steps and alternatives are then decided and made into “policy packages” of closure the Jarak-Dolly localization.

The next stage is the implementation of policies relating to the preparation and deployment of the implementing organ and the use of resources. In this case, Jarak-Dolly was officially closed on June 18, 2014 in which the entire package of policies was applied. After this implementation would emerge the performance and impact of the policy. To measure and assess the performance and impact of this policy, the policy evaluation stage is carried out. The previous description explained that the success of the Surabaya municipal government in closing the

Jarak-Dolly localization reflected two aspects, namely the seriousness of the Surabaya municipal government as the initiator and the maturity of the policy formulation phase. Mean that it is necessary to do a more in-depth study, especially from the aspect of public policy formulation so that this best practice can be explored and described as a reference for other cities in developing countries that face the same problem of prostitution.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

This research is conducted by qualitative approach with case study type. Data collection techniques used was in-depth interviews, focus group discussions and document collection. Informant research is determined by purposive technique. The data analysis techniques using interactive models from Miles and Huberman consisted of the following stages.

Data collection, i.e., data collection efforts in this study using interview techniques, FGD and document collection. Data reduction which summarizes, chooses the essentials, focuses on the things that are important, sought the theme and pattern. Thus the data has been reduced will provide a clearer picture and facilitating. Presentation of data, i.e., simplify data such as making short descriptions, charts, relationships between categories. By displaying the data, it will simplify to understand what is happening and planning the next work based on what is understood.

Generated conclusion, the activity concludes the findings of the data that has been processed. The preliminary conclusions raised are temporary and will be varied if there is no strong and supportive evidence at the later stage of data collection. But if the conclusions raised in the initial stages are supported by valid and consistent evidence when the researcher returns to the field to collect the data, the conclusion put forward is a credible conclusion.

As for technique of determination of data validity, this research use triangulation. Wiersma as quoted by Sugiyono (2008) explains that, “triangulation is qualitative cross-validation. It assesses the sufficiency of the data according to the convergence of multiple data sources or multiple data collection procedures”. Referring to this definition, it can be understood that triangulation is a credibility test technique which in this technique is carried out a series of cross-tests of various data sources, various data collection techniques and across time.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Policy formulation: The quality of public policy generated by a government institution is strongly

influenced by the quality of the formulation implementation. Many policies are low quality because it is at the stage of the formulation was done at random or without a clear and definite formula. This is because at this stage the problem of the formulation is elaborated, alternative actions are formulated and selected to be public policy. The best-practice policy from the closure of Jarak-Dolly localization has several advantages in its policy formulation phase as follows.

The Surabaya municipal government successfully mobilized support from vertical, horizontal and cross-dimensional sources. The closing policy of Jarak-Dolly localization causes a lot of denial actions by the sex workers, pimps as well as people who were economically dependent on the existence of the localization. This rejection was also supported by some political actors (legislative members and political parties where the Jarak-Dolly is an enclave of votes) and also by some officials in the Surabaya government. This rejection was classified as massive and strong, so, at first there was a concern that the execution or closure of the Jarak-Dolly localization would cause chaos. This condition was addressed by the Surabaya municipal government with efforts to mobilize both vertical and horizontal support. The mobilization of support was undertaken by the Surabaya municipal government by cooperating with the provincial government of East Java and the Central Government (in this case was the ministry of social affairs) to participate in executing the Jarak-Dolly localization. Horizontal mobilization was conducted by synchronizing the Regional Device Work Unit (SKPD) who was in charge of the problem to play an active and synergic role in efforts to close Jarak-Dolly localization, minimizing the risk of closure and follow-up post-closure. The mobilization of cross-dimensional support was the effort of the Surabaya municipal government to gain support for the closure of Jarak-Dolly localization from various elements of society (such as religious organizations, women's organizations, student organizations, etc.) which countered or rejected the existence of prostitution and localization. Cooperation was also carried out by the government of Surabaya with other regions (other districts/cities) where became the area of origin of the Jarak-Dolly prostitutes. This is because the sex workers from outside Surabaya repatriated to the area of origin that definitely requires synergy with other regional governments.

The Surabaya municipal government successfully chose socialization approach towards target group: Jarak-Dolly localization consisted of several different groups of needs and motives that required different handling, i.e., the sex

workers, pimps, homestead owner and communities whose economies depended on the localization activities. This group difference requires different models of socialization and approaches. For the sex workers and pimps, socialization was undertaken on the negative risks of prostitution and compensation to be provided if the Jarak-Dolly was closed. For the owners of the homestead, given the socialization of the homestead purchase by the Surabaya municipal government. As for the people whose economies depended on the activity of localization, socialization of post-closure empowerment programs was implemented. In addition to a dialogical and directed socialization, the Surabaya municipal government also prepared a legal firm instrument for the “provocateurs” who intended to create chaos when the closure event took place.

The Surabaya government successfully formulated compensation for the target group: One of the contents of the closing package of Jarak-Dolly localization was the compensation for the sex workers and pimps. The amount of compensation was varied but the average was IDR 5.050.000 per person with details of IDR 3000.000 for economic empowerment of the sex workers/pimps, itinerary return fare of IDR 250.000 and daily life guarantee as of IDR 20.000 for 90 days (IDR 1800.000). The total compensation budget reached IDR 8 billion for the handling of the sex workers coming from social ministries and IDR 1.5 billion for handling pimps from the East Java Provincial Government.

Surabaya municipal government was courageous to formulate and issued a policy to buy homesteads to be asset of the municipal government: One of the radical parts of the Jarak-Dolly localization closing policy package was the purchase of homesteads in the Jarak-Dolly localization by the Surabaya municipal government. This is actually the focus of the Surabaya municipal government budget. No half-hearted, the Surabaya municipal government poured APBD funds amounting to IDR 16 billion in the early stages to buy homesteads which later became asset of the Surabaya municipal government. In the next stage, land acquisition would also be cleared until the budget reaches IDR 65 billion for revitalization as well as land acquisition. This land would be utilized to build public facilities in the area such as schools, police stations integrated service post (posyandu) and public health centre (puskesmas) and be done step by step for the smooth integration of the urban village. In addition to coaching and built public facilities, the residents would also be benefited the infrastructure that would be repaired. The purpose of the homeless

liberation, land acquisition and revitalization of this area is intended to the traces of prostitution could be completely faded.

The Surabaya municipal government successfully formulated sustainable community empowerment activities both pre and post of the closure of the localization: Recorded from 2009 the Surabaya municipal government has conducted a series of training and spiritual spells (reciting) for the sex workers, pimps and communities around the Jarak-Dolly localization. Training that has been given such as catering, handy-craft, formation and coaching for group of joint ventures (KUBE). For spiritual activities, guidance and counselling is conducted to every cluster of villages in the Jarak-Dolly localization.

The closure policy of localization is a courageous policy issued by the Surabaya municipal government. Given the magnitude of the Jarak-Dolly localization, the complexity of the problem, the political support for the Jarak-Dolly existence and the potential for disruption at the closing of this policy should be formulated in a neat and clear manner. The five points above led to the closure of Jarak-Dolly localization went smoothly without any chaos and until this article was written the prostitution stretch in the Jarak-Dolly localization was invisible.

The five steps formulated by the Surabaya municipal government are a key factor in the successful closure of Jarak-Dolly localization. In this study, it will be compared with best practice closing localization or eradication of prostitution in other countries. Malaysia is a country with socio-cultural characteristics is relatively similar to Indonesia and also faces the problem of prostitution (human trafficking) and is also successful in overcoming it. The solution formulated and run by the Malaysian government is as follows:

Urge for public cooperation that the general public should care and relieve to solve the problems including reporting to police and other relevant authorities if they knew human trafficking violation. Enforcing the 'One District One Investigation' approach, i.e., taking initiatives in targeting 'One district one investigative officer' as an expert to ensure cases of trafficked persons and migrant smuggling are handled systematically.

Establish a work unit to coordinate and resolve trafficking and migrant smuggling cases at the state level was led by a police chief. Strengthen legal regulatory mechanisms including amending the Act by incorporating migrant smuggling as new violations and increasing penalties for trafficking in persons. Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) are also updated in accordance with amendments to the Act and include guidelines for cases

involving forced labour. Integrate operations involving intelligence sharing among law enforcement agencies as well as security tightening at border checkpoints. In addition, conducting public awareness campaigns continuously through various printed and electronic media including trailer shows on local television networks and jingle radio broadcasts on radio and billboard installations.

Mobilization of NGOs, there were five NGOs who appointed to MAPO to abolish slavery in Asia. These NGO organizations have contributed their ideas and expertise and participated in organizing public awareness campaigns. For example, NWCO organized state-of-the-art awareness campaigns in addition to organizing Training of Trainers (ToT) to train more spokes-person about trafficking.

In cooperation with other countries, Malaysia utilizes bilateral cooperation with strategic partner countries such as Australia, UK, USA and the Netherlands. At the multilateral level, Malaysia has signed the United Nations Convention on Transnational Crime. In addition, Malaysia also works with international agencies such as United Nation of High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR), the International Labour Organization (ILO), the United Nations Intergovernmental Organization for Trafficking in Persons (UNIAP) and the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) to deal with these crimes.

CONCLUSION

The seven solutions make Malaysia successfully fighting the prostitution (human trafficking) that occurred. Compared to the Jarak-Dolly localization closure policy, there are several significant differences as follows: Malaysia uses approach that leads to law enforcement whereas the closure policy of Jarak-Dolly localization was more with a socio-economic approach. The main policy actor in Malaysia was the central government, while the (state) region is merely an executive. On the contrary, the Jarak-Dolly localization closure, the main actor (from initiation to execution) was the local government (Surabaya municipal government) while the central government (The Ministry of Social Affair) was just a companion.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study was supported by research grant from Institut Teknologi Sepuluh Nopember, Surabaya Indonesia. We also thank our colleagues from REDI Consultant, Wawan Setiawan and Kalvin Edo Wahyudi, who supported for data collection and provided insight and expertise that greatly improved this manuscript.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, J.E., 2006. *Public Policymaking: An Introduction*. 6th Edn., Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, Massachusetts, USA., ISBN:9780618506866, Pages: 331.
- Dye, T.R., 2008. *Understanding Public Policy*. 12th Edn., Pearson Prentice Hall, New Jersey, USA., ISBN:9780136131472, Pages: 354.
- Faizal, A., 2014a. [Dolly localization is closed today]. Kompas, Surabaya, Java, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) <http://nationalgeographic.co.id/berita/2014/06/kawasan-lokalisasi-dolly-ditutup-hari-ini>.
- Faizal, A., 2014b. [Risma as a mayor in Surabaya closed all of sparkling story at Dolly localisation of prostitution]. Kompas, Surabaya, Java, Indonesia. (In Indonesian).
- Knoepfel, P., C. Larrue, F. Varone and M. Hill, 2007. *Public Policy Analysis*. MPG Books Ltd., Bodmin, England.
- Lestari, S., 2014. [In approaching of localization dolly closing]. British Broadcasting Corporation Indonesia (BBC), Surabaya, Java, Indonesia. (In Indonesian).
- Michael, H. and M. Ramesh, 1995. *Studying Public Policy: Policy Cycles and Policy Subsystems*. 3rd Edn., Oxford University Press, Oxford, England, UK., ISBN:9780195409765, Pages: 239.
- Nurqomar, 2012. [One night, RP.2 billion spin in prostitution]. Poskotanews, Surabaya, Java, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) <http://poskotanews.com/2012/05/27/satu-malam-rp2-miliar-berputar-di-pelacuran/>.
- Subarsono, A.G., 2009. [Analytical of Policy Public (Concept, Theory and Application)]. Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta, USA.,.
- Sugiyono, 2008. [The Method of Research are Qualitatif and R&D]. Alfabeta, Bandung, Indonesia. (In Indonesian).
- Wibowo, K.S., 2014. [Points of dolly closing declaration]. Tempo, Jakarta, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) <https://nasional.tempo.co/read/1074415/perpustakaan-unisma-dinamai-joko-widodo>.
- Yakub, E.M., 2017. [Closing of Dolly Controversial]. Antara, Surabaya, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) <https://jatim.antaranews.com/lihat/berita/132358/kontroversi-penutupan-dolly>.