

Gender and Bureaucracy (The Recruitment of Administrative Officials in the Gender Perspective)

Ariana, Muhammad Ramli, Rifdan and Yusminah Hala
Department of Public Administration, Universitas Negeri Makassar,
Jln. Bonto Lang kasa Kampus Gunung Sari Baru, Makassar, South Sulawesi, Indonesia

Abstract: This study aims at analyzing the mechanism of the recruitment of administrative officials from the perspective of gender in the provincial education department of South Sulawesi. The method that was used was a qualitative research with case study approach. The results showed that the mechanism of the recruitment of administrative officials in the provincial education department of South Sulawesi is not run according to the rules of normative or legal basis established by the government. Gender mainstreaming policy echoed by the government has not enough to become a driving force when gender access is portrayed in the context of the recruitment of administrative officials. Men and women employees have equal chances and opportunities to be administrative officials in provincial education department of South Sulawesi. This gender mainstreaming policy should contribute positively to the changing role of women and men employees in the bureaucracy of provincial education department in South Sulawesi.

Key words: Mainstreaming gender, the recruitment of administrative officials, mechanism, recruitment, established, provincial education

INTRODUCTION

The analysis of gender differences in the organization or administration in the study of the state bureaucracy started to emerge around the 1990's and it is called gender perspective or feminist perspective. The growing awareness of gender inequality in the administration of the state cannot be separated from the fact that many women were involved in public organizations. In addition, there is a high demand for the award values of human rights and democracy. The gender perspective in the state administration theory is not only discussing the issue of women's participation in the bureaucracy but also criticizing the dominance of the men perspective in organizational theory according to Shafritz and Hyde (1997).

Gender mainstreaming policy analysis is an analysis to identify and understand the division of labor or roles of men and women. It is the control access toward the resources development, participation in the development process and the benefits that they can enjoy (Anonymou, 2016). The relationship pattern between men and women is unequal. In practice, it concerns other factors such as marginalization, stereotypes, social class, race and ethnicity.

Gender is equality and justice. Gender equality according to the Regulation of Minister of Home Affairs No. 15 in 2008 is the similarity of conditions for men and women to get opportunities and rights as human beings,

so that, they can contribute and participate in the activities of a political, economic, social, cultural, defense and security and equality in enjoying the development. It means that gender equality is a process to be fair for both men and women (Anonymous, 1945).

This study tried to describe the gender mainstreaming policy in the context of the bureaucracy in terms of the appointments of the administrative official that always become an issue and a subject of debate in various groups of people (Anonymous, 1984). Philosophically, gender is equality and justice experienced by men and women in their role within the bureaucracy. It is based on the Constitution of 1945 in section 26, paragraph 1 which states that all citizens have equal status in the law and government, then Article 28D paragraph 1, Article 28H paragraph 2, Article 28I paragraph 2 concerning the right to guarantee legal certainty, the right to the ease and special treatment to obtain the same opportunities and benefits in order to achieve equality and justice as well as the right to be free from discriminatory treatment on any basis as well as protection from discriminatory treatment. The Law No. 7 in 1984 on the elimination of all Forms of Discrimination (CEDAW Convention).

Since, Indonesia had been independent in 1945, the position of women in the implementation of development and government is guaranteed by the state as stated in the 1945 Constitution, Article 27. The implementation of constitutional guarantee is expected to contribute positively to the development of women in various

activities and decision-making. The number of women in Indonesia reached 50% more than the population of Indonesia. However, there are not many women who can occupy key positions, both in political organizations, legislative and executive, especially in the bureaucracy (Dwijowijoto, 2008).

The reality shows that constitutionally women are recognized having an equal position with men as a citizen to be able to take part in every aspect of life either politic, bureaucratic, economic, legal, social or culture. However in practice, the recognition of a constitutional manner are limited to a normative nature (Anonymous, 2002). It can be seen in the practice of social life, politics and government. Men occupy strategic positions in government bureaucracy that is more dominant. The position of women is no more than a men companion at the ceremonial activities.

After the new order regime fell in 1998 and the reform government was created, the government is getting serious about the mandate of the 1945 constitution and the demands of women who expect equality in the implementation of development (Anonymous, 2000). The government issued, Presidential Instruction No. 9 in 2000 on Gender Mainstreaming in National Development. The government has committed to making mainstreaming gender issues in the implementation of the development. This presidential instruction requires the central and local governments to do mainstreaming gender into the entire development process.

In integrating gender mainstreaming policy (gender responsive), the government issued several policies, the Home Affairs Minister Decree number 132 in 2003 on general guidelines for the implementation of gender mainstreaming in the regional development. It was then replaced with a policy such as Home Affairs Minister Regulation number 15 in 2008. Furthermore, the regulation was followed-up by establishing Presidential Regulation number 5 in 2010 on the National Medium-Term Development Plan or RPJMN 2010-2014.

The goal of gender mainstreaming policy in RPJMD is emphasizing the importance of improving gender equality which is characterized by several things (Anonymous, 2012). The first is the increasing of the quality of life and the role of women, especially in health, education, economy including access to control over resources and politics. The second is the increasing of the percentage of coverage of women victims of violence who receive complaints handling (Engineer *et al.*, 2000). The third is the growing of the effectiveness of institutional gender mainstreaming in planning, budgeting, implementation, monitoring and policy evaluation and development programs that are responsive to national and regional levels (Martin, 2005).

The results of research conducted by the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Anonymous (2012) shows the representation of women in the judiciary in which the supreme court is 12%, the constitutional court is 11% and the Judicial commission and the corruption eradication commission is 0% (Moser, 1989). The data of the state minister for utilization of state apparatus shows that the amount of civil servant is 4.5981 million people consisting 46.48% women and 53.52% men with the following women's representation composition: Echelon I is 9%, Echelon II is 7%, Echelon III is 16% and Echelon IV is 24%. The study showed that there is an increasing number of the women participation who hold positions of echelon I-IV of the executive organization. However, the position of the women is still centered on Echelon IV. This study also shows that the higher the administrative officials, the lower the position of women. Based on the previous description, it shows that the composition and role of women in a judicial and executive institution are still relatively small (Grindle, 1980).

Based on the obtained data, the administrative officials in the government of South Sulawesi province between civil servants (men) and civil servants (women) showed that the administrative officials of echelon are 7924 consisting of 5,682 men (72%) and 2,242 women (28%). Further analysis showed that the highest civil servant in the echelon IV is 4,322 men and 1,987 women. The Echelon III is 1,117 men and 232 women. The Echelon II is 241 men and three women Gender Statistics of South Sulawesi province (Nugroho, 2007).

Gender mainstreaming policy in filling the position of administrative officials in the bureaucracy of the National Education Department of South Sulawesi province is interesting to be investigated. It is based on the consideration that the Department of Education became one of six institutions that became a pilot ministries or pilot project of gender mainstreaming set by the government. Another consideration is that the National Education Department of South Sulawesi province becomes an institution that gets serious attention from the government of South Sulawesi as it is a spearheading institution in the implementation of the free education program and it is also the main program the provincial government of South Sulawesi.

The intriguing question that is raised is why the composition and the role of women in the bureaucracy of South Sulawesi in Provincial Education Department are still relatively smaller than the composition and the role of men in the same sector. How is this issue viewed from the policy side? In the variable of the policy content, Grindle (Subarsono, 2005) considers that the implementation of policies involves politics. From the first to the fourth element, namely interest affected, type of benefits, the extent of change envisioned and the site if decision-making, it appears that the political role is still

strong. For example on the first element, Anonymous (2008) states that the type of public policy that is created will bring a certain impact on the kinds of political activity. The political role can still be traced in the second and the fourth elements.

Wahab (2003) asserts that the implementation of the policy is the implementation of the basic policy decisions usually in the form of legislation. However, it can be in the form orders or the important executive decisions or judicial decisions (Anonymous 2003). The decision is to identify the problems that need to be solved. In addition, it also explicitly mentions the goals or targets to be achieved and the various ways to structure or organize the implementation process. Then, how are these policies implemented in the bureaucracy?

The famous scientists who introduced the model of the bureaucratic organization is Max Weber. It can be stated that the concept of bureaucracy proposed by Weber still becomes a reference until today although other scientists criticized it. Weber discusses the organization's role in society and asks questions about the organizational form for an industrial society that was found in Europe in the late 19th century. He tried to describe an ideal organization and organization that is purely rational and which will provide maximum operating efficiency (Moser, 1993).

In the context of Indonesia, government institutions have an extended hierarchy, the written procedures and operating standards, the detailed specialization and career officials that become the characteristic of Weberian bureaucracy. Therefore, those institutions are often referred to as the government bureaucracy. The concept of Weberian bureaucracy (Martin, 2005) assumes that the bureaucracy is formed by political forces independently. It is beyond or above the political actors who compete with each other. The government bureaucracy is positioned as a neutral force. It prioritizes the interests of the state and people as a whole. Therefore, whatever the political forces, the government and the bureaucracy provide the best service to public.

The career of a civil servant must go through a clear career system. With a clear career system, organizations can establish a standard of competence, expertise and professionalism that are also obvious for the employees. Based on government regulation No. 13 in 2003 on the recruitment of civil servants in administrative officials as the change in the government regulation No. 100 in 2000 and as the elaboration of the Law No. 43 in 1999 on the principles of civil service, it implies that each head of the institution (including the head of region or city) set the pattern of the career of civil servants in their environment based on the archetypal of the career of civil servants (Article 12). To be appointed by the administrative officials, the civil servants must meet the following requirements (government regulation No. 100 in 2000

concerning the recruitment of civil servants in the administrative officials, Article 5 and 6). First, they have status as a civil servant. The civil servant candidates cannot have administrative officials because they is still on a probation period and they do not have sufficient position. Second, they must, at least have one level below the position of a specified level. Third, they have the determined qualifications and educational levels. Fourth, all of the elements of performance appraisal (DP 3) at least get a good score in the last 2 years. Fifth, they have the necessary competency. Competence is the ability and characteristics possessed by civil servants in the form of knowledge, skills, behavior and attitudes that are necessary for performing their duties, so that, they can perform their duties professionally, effectively and efficiently. Sixth, they must be physically and mentally healthy.

In addition to the requirements that are mentioned above, several factors must also be considered namely senior in rank, age, education and training (training position) and official experience. Appointment, transfer and dismissal of civil servants in the administrative officials are determined by the decision of the competent authorities and they must be sworn in and took the oath in the presence of the authorized official.

Rostyaningsih in his presentation on the training of the analysis of gender in higher education, said that the concept of gender is created from the idea that there is an unequal relationship between women and men inside and outside the family that needs to be changed. For example, from the unequal social relations to equal social relations because both are an important factor in family life. Furthermore, Rostyaningsih said that generally gender can be defined as differences in roles, position and characteristics attached to men and women through the construction socially and culturally. Unfortunately, gender has been misunderstood and considered as nature which means the provision of God. For example, educating children, managing and maintaining the cleanliness and beautifying the house are the social and cultural construction of a particular society. In fact, these roles can be interchanged because it could be done by men. The study of gender is not only an attempt to understand women or men separately but also how to put them in the context of a social system in which both become an integral part of it (Moser, 1989).

Based on the above phenomenon, the key problem that is discussed in this study is the cause why gender is unequal in the administrative officials formulated through the mechanism of how recruitment is based on the perspective of gender mainstreaming in the South Sulawesi education agency.

Based on the description above, this study aims at analyzing the mechanism of appointments for

administrative officials in the perspective of gender mainstreaming of provincial education department in the South Sulawesi (Moser, 1993).

MATERIALS AND METHODS

This research was conducted in provincial education Department of South Sulawesi and some institutions related to this research. This research was a qualitative research with a case study approach. The informants consisted of the secretary of the advisory board position of South Sulawesi Province, the secretary of the regional employment board of South Sulawesi Province and Head of the Provincial education department of South Sulawesi as the key informants. The staffs of education Department and the staffs of regional employment board of South Sulawesi province. The main instrument in this study was the researchers themselves. The supporting instruments that the researchers used were interview guidelines and observation guidelines. The data were collected through, interview, document study and observation. The data were analyzed using qualitative descriptive analysis. The process of data analysis was an interactive analysis model proposed by Miles and Huberman (1992) that consists of data reduction, data presentation or data display, verification and conclusion.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The gender mainstreaming policies have been implemented in provincial education department of South Sulawesi since the gender mainstreaming was launched in 2000. It is in line with the information submitted by H.M., who said that "in 2002 the gender that has occurred in education and education is directed to the teacher as a professional (Anonymous, 2010a, b). Teachers are encouraged to pay attention to gender, even it has included in the curriculum at schools". What is presented by H.M. is also supported by the AS statement who said that "in the Education Department, the gender mainstreaming is a small part. It is in the form of working group and is not in a structural position". The explanation of the informants above illustrates that gender mainstreaming has been implemented in Education Department of South Sulawesi province, since, 2000 along with the launching of the program performed by president. However, the regulation that is happening still seems to be more directed at the public as an object program and the regulation does not consider the importance of mainstreaming implementation. In addition, based on the information described above, there is a reality which indicates that the program is simply attached to the sub-section that shows how small space can be performed by the executor to change the system that has been entrenched (Anonymous, 2007). It also shows that

the policy makers do not consider this program as an important priority in the activities of the bureaucracy especially in the world of education. Based on the above reality, the authors explore how this gender mainstreaming in bureaucracy in the context of the recruitment of administrative officials by finding out how the mechanisms take place in the process of recruitment of administrative officials in the provincial education department of South Sulawesi.

The mechanism of the recruitment of administrative officials: The recruitment of civil servants in a position either horizontally or vertically is the transfer of employees from one position or place to another position or another place that is followed by the duties, responsibilities and authority. The recruitment of civil servants that is most interesting in the management of employees, from one position to the higher position is usually accompanied by an increase in income as well as other facilities. This job promotion is an appreciation of the results of performance as well as a career development for the employees (Anonymous, 2008).

The policy of the recruitment of administrative officials is something that is very normative in the structuring of civil servants. It is a process that is legally entitled to do within the government bureaucracy. There are some regulations governing employment. One of them is Government Regulation No. 41 in 2007 concerning the regional organization which regulates the mechanisms and provisions of mutation.

The policy for the recruitment of employees in certain positions in the region or city is the authority of local staff development that is head of the local government based on the Government Regulation No. 63 in 2009 as the change Government Regulation No. 9, 2003. Nonetheless, head of the local government still has to refer to the existing regulations.

Planning and determining civil servant for administrative officials in Education Department of South Sulawesi province factually is not run as a rule mechanism that should be. In practice, sometimes there is a closed recruitment and placement. It is only at a certain level or a certain echelon. The institution units usually only accept new officials if they are assigned to the organization or unit to carry out the task.

This supports the findings of the researchers that the mechanism to identify the rules of civil servants who fulfill the requirements to be administrative officials did not function as expected. In addition, cross-sector coordination related to employment can also be said to be lacking. It demonstrates that the mechanism for the recruitment of administrative officials only become the willingness of certain level and it is a closed recruitment. This condition does not give a positive side for women and men equally as expected and it can create a deviation,

bribery and patronage culture. In terms of quantity, the number of women employees in the provincial education department of South Sulawesi is higher than men employees. The data in the Department of Education per-July 2014 show that men employees are 376 people and men employees are 354 people. It shows that the number of women employees is larger than men employees. From the aspect of effectiveness, the number of women employees is higher than men employees in the Education Department of South Sulawesi province that become a potential and reliable human resources to run the government and educational services to the public. From the aspect of equal opportunity, the involvement of women employees in the decision-making process that would only happen if it is in a strategic position level will have an impact on the quality of public policy that is filled with shades of equality and gender bias.

Access for women and men in the context of the bureaucracy in the Department of Education in South Sulawesi province: The results further shows that head of the region has enough great attention to women in terms of the level of the concept and the implementation of gender mainstreaming. However when the draft was withdrawn on the bureaucracy in the context of the process of the recruitment administrative officials, it shows that there is an inconsistent process from the regional head. It can be explained in detail as follows (Anonymous, 1999a, b).

Based on the data, the distribution of women employees and men employees in Education Department of South Sulawesi Province based on the diversity of their position, women employees should have more opportunities to be administrative officials. It is proven by the ratio between men employees and women based on the number of administrative officials compared to the number of men employees and women is 1: 6.5% for men employees and 1: 2.6% for women employees. The comparison shows that there is still gender inequality in the distribution of civil servants in the Department of Education of South Sulawesi province. The profile of women employee that is compared to men employees in the bureaucracy in the Department of Education in South Sulawesi province shows that there is a discrepancy between the number of women employees and men employees in a structural position. It is indicated by the number of men employees who hold the structural positions that reached more than a half number of women employees who have structural positions that are 23:10 especially when it is compared with the overall number of men and women employees in the Department of Education. The imbalance indicates that the bureaucratic structure of the Department of Education of South Sulawesi province still tends contained gender bias so that the concept of gender mainstreaming policy in the

Department of Education in South Sulawesi province still requires a strong commitment from policy makers. The concept or principle of gender mainstreaming is not enough by only assessing how data disaggregated women and men, how socialization is performed related to gender mainstreaming in education. It is also important to observe how gender mainstreaming contributes positively to the position of men and women employees in the bureaucracy in the department of Education in South Sulawesi province as the research location.

CONCLUSION

The mechanism for the recruitment of administrative officials in the Department of Education in South Sulawesi province does still not run in accordance with the normative rules or legal basis established by the government that is the Government Regulation No. 13 in 2002 regarding the amendment of Government Regulation number 100 in 2000 mainly emphasized in chapters 5, 6 and Article 7 of the regulations for civil servants in structural positions. Gender is portrayed in the context of the recruitment of administrative officials by viewing how their access and opportunity achieve that position. Therefore, women and men employees have the same opportunities and chance to become administrative officials in the Department of Education in South Sulawesi province. This imbalance indicates that there is still gender bias in the structure of the bureaucracy in the Department of Education in South Sulawesi province.

REFERENCES

- Anonymous, 2016. [Press release: Realizing gender mainstreaming in palangkaraya]. Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia. (In Indonesian)
- Anonymous, 1945. [Of the 1945 constitution article 27 and 28 on human rights]. Indonesian Law, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) <https://translate.google.com/translate?hl=en&sl=id&u=http://pemerintahandiindonesia.blogspot.com/2014/10/uud-1945-pasal-27-dan-28-tentang-hak.html&prev=search>
- Anonymous, 1984. [Convention on the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women]. Laws of the Republic Indonesia Number 7 Year 1984, President of the Republic of Indonesia, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) http://pih.kemlu.go.id/files/UU_1984_7.pdf
- Anonymous, 1999. [Human rights]. Laws of the Republic Indonesia Number 39 Year 1999, President of the Republic of Indonesia, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) https://translate.google.com/translate?hl=en&sl=id&u=http://www.radioprssni.com/prssnnew/internal/link/legal/uu_ham.htm&prev=search

- Anonymous, 1999. [ILO convention law NO. 111 concerning discrimination in respect of employment and occupation (ILO convention on discrimination in jobs and positions)]. Laws of the Republic Indonesia Number 21 year 1999, Indonesia. (In Indonesian)
- Anonymous, 2000. [Gender major guidance in national development]. President of the republic of Indonesia, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) https://translate.google.com/translate?hl=en&sl=id&u=http://www.depko.go.id/uploads/media/01_Inpres_No.9_Thn_2000_-_PUG_dalam_Pembangunan_Nasional.pdf&prev=search
- Anonymous, 2002. [The change government regulation number 100 year 2000 about civil servant civil servants in structural position]. Peraturan pemerintah republik indonesia nomor 13 tahun 2002, President of the Republic of Indonesia, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) http://kepegawaian.untad.ac.id/upload/40PP_No_%2013_th_%202002.pdf
- Anonymous, 2003. [General guidelines for gender implementation implementation in development in the area]. Decree of the Minister of State Number: 132 Year 2003, Minister of Home Affairs Republic of Indonesia, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) https://translate.google.com/translate?hl=en&sl=id&u=http://jdih.surakarta.go.id/download.php%3Fdt_produk_hukum_id%3D1578&pre
- Anonymous, 2007. [Organization of the regional devices with the grace of God the most ESA]. Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia, President of the Republic of Indonesia, Indonesia. (In Indonesian)
- Anonymous, 2008. [General guidelines for gender procurement implementation in the area]. Peraturan Menteri Dalam Negeri Nomor 15 Tahun 2008, Indonesia. (In Indonesian)
- Anonymous, 2008. [General guidelines implementation of gender registration in the area]. Regulation of the Minister of State Number 15 Year 2008, Menteri Dalam Negeri Republik Indonesia, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) <http://ngada.org/bn927-2011.htm>
- Anonymous, 2010. [National middle development plan year 2010-2014]. Peraturan Presiden Republik Indonesia Nomor 5 Tahun 2010, President of the Republic of Indonesia, Indonesia. (In Indonesian) https://www.kemenkeu.go.id/sites/default/files/perpres2010_5.pdf
- Anonymous, 2010. [Regional action plan: Gender mainstreaming in South Sulawesi]. Badan Pemberdayaan Perempuan Dan Keluarga Berencana, Indonesia. (In Indonesian)
- Anonymous, 2012. [Press release: PUG encourages competent and professional state apparatus]. Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia. (In Indonesian)
- Dwijowijoto, R.N., 2008. [Gender and Public Administration: The Study of the Quality of Gender Equality in Post-Reform Indonesia's Public Administration, 1998-2002]. Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta, Indonesia, ISBN:9786028300476, Pages: 349 (In Indonesian).
- Engineer, A.A., F. Wajidi and C.F. Assegaf, 2000. [Women's Rights in Islam]. Lembaga Studi dan Pengembangan Perempuan dan Anak, Yogyakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Grindle, M.S., 1980. Politics and Policy Implementation in the Third World. Princeton University Press, Princeton, New Jersey, ISBN: 9780691021959, Pages: 310.
- Martin, A., 2005. [Bureaucracy]. Penerbit Tiara Wacana Publisher, Yogyakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Miles, M.B. and M. Huberman, 1992. [Qualitative Data Analysis]. UI Press, Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Moser, C.O.N., 1989. Gender planning in the third world: Meeting practical and strategic gender needs. *World Dev.*, 17: 1799-1825.
- Moser, C.O.N., 1993. Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training. Routledge, Abingdon, UK., ISBN:9780415056212, Pages: 285.
- Nugroho, R., 2007. [Policy Analysis]. Gramedia Publisher, Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).
- Shafritz, J.M. and A.C. Hyde, 1997. Classic of Public Administration. 4th Edn., Harcourt Brace College Publishers, Florida, USA., ISBN:9780030193828, Pages: 596.
- Subarsono, A.G., 2005. [Public Policy Analysis: Concepts, Theories and Applications]. Pustaka Pelajar Publisher, Yogyakarta, Indonesia, ISBN:9789793721729, Pages: 138 (In Indonesian).
- Wahab, S., 2003. [Policy Analysis: From Formulation to Implementation of State Policy]. Bumi Aksara Publisher, Jakarta, Indonesia, (In Indonesian).